

JMHHP

Journal of
Music History
Pedagogy

VOLUME 11, NUMBER 1 (2021)
<http://www.ams-net.org/ojs/index.php/jmhp/>

Articles

- Uncovering a Diverse Early Music 1–21
ALICE V. CLARK
- Object Lessons: Teaching Musicology 21–45
through Museum Collections
ELIZABETH A. CLENDINNING, ANDREW GURSTELLE
-

Roundtable

- Pandemic Lessons 46–56
ERIN BAUER, ALEXANDRA MONCHICK, ESTHER MORGAN-ELLIS,
MARY NATVIG, KRISTEN STRANDBERG, REBA WISSNER
-

Reviews

- Review of *Resonances: Engaging Music in Its Cultural Context* 57–60
edited by Esther M. Morgan-Ellis
K. DAWN GRAPES
- Review of *Norton Guide to Teaching Music History* 61–65
edited by C. Matthew Balensuela
LAURA MOORE PRUETT

Uncovering a Diverse Early Music¹

ALICE V. CLARK

The “Unite the Right” rally in Charlottesville in August 2017 became a call to action for medievalists across the United States to find new and more explicit ways to reject racism and white supremacy. While pseudo-medieval symbols had long been used by white supremacists, social media exploded with images of participants in Charlottesville wielding, for instance, shields bearing a black eagle, associated with the Holy Roman Empire and used in Germany through the Nazi era to the present day.² The Medieval Academy of America, along with 29 other organizations, responded with a statement a few days after the rally, which read in part:

1. This conversation has been growing in volume for a while now—long enough that I can’t always pinpoint where I first found out about some of the material I include here. Discussions at the virtual Teaching Music History Conference and continuing on the AMS Pedagogy Study Group Facebook group have been invaluable, and bibliographies and resource lists have been circulated more and more, most notably the new Inclusive Early Music site (<https://inclusiveearlymusic.org/>), which will be a tremendous benefit to all of us going forward. Individuals who have been particularly influential and helpful to me include Karen Cook, Andrew Dell’Antonio, Daniel DiCenso, Gillian Gower, Jeannette DiBernardo Jones, Rebecca Maloy, Luisa Nardini, Laurie Stras, Jennifer Thomas, and Elizabeth Randell Upton; I apologize to anyone I may have neglected to include here.

Earlier versions of this essay were presented at the annual meeting of the Southern Chapter of the American Musicological Society (Tallahassee, February 15, 2020) and the virtual Teaching Music History Conference (June 2020). I am grateful to the other participants in those sessions—especially Jennifer Thomas and Douglass Seaton for AMS-S and Margaret Walker and Lars Christensen for TMHC—and those who commented on both papers and participated in later discussions. This version was significantly improved by the comments of the anonymous readers for the *Journal*, and I am also grateful for the help and encouragement of its editor, Sara Haefeli.

2. See the photos published with Josephine Livingstone, “Racism, Medievalism, and the White Supremacists of Charlottesville,” *The New Republic*, August 15, 2017, <https://newrepublic.com/article/144320/racism-medievalism-white-supremacists-charlottesville>. The history of the black eagle is complex; however, the young men using the symbol are quite possibly aligning themselves with Nazi Germany. In any case, the evocation of an imagined ethnically pure past seems clear.

2 *Journal of Music History Pedagogy*

As scholars of the medieval world we are disturbed by the use of a nostalgic but inaccurate myth of the Middle Ages by racist movements in the United States. By using imagined medieval symbols, or names drawn from medieval terminology, they create a fantasy of a pure, white Europe that bears no relationship to reality. This fantasy not only hurts people in the present, it also distorts the past.³

This concern to push back against the misappropriation of the past extended to the musicological community, and the call for papers for the 2018 Medieval and Renaissance Music Conference asked scholars to consider

the politics around researching, teaching and performing Med & Ren music in a time when racists, white nationalists (not only in the US) and xenophobes feel emboldened. How do we teach Med & Ren music courses that do not appear to be safe havens for white supremacists? That challenge ahistorical views of Med & Ren as all white (male) and Christian?⁴

The conference featured a packed session with papers by Brandi Neal, Elizabeth Randell Upton, and Samantha Bassler, followed by a lively discussion that continued beyond the conference.⁵

The call to diversify the material we study and especially teach is, of course, not new, but what is notable here is the explicit focus on the Middle Ages and

3. The statement also noted that “medieval Europe was not the entire medieval world.” For the complete statement, see “Medievalists Respond to Charlottesville,” *The Medieval Academy Blog*, August 18, 2017, <http://www.themedievalacademyblog.org/medievalists-respond-to-charlottesville/>. There is in fact ample visual and textual evidence of non-Europeans and non-Christians in medieval and early modern Europe, evidence that has been extensively studied and taught by historians, art historians, and scholars of literature. See for instance Jonathan Hsy and Julie Ormanski, “Race and Medieval Studies: A Partial Bibliography,” *postmedieval: a journal of medieval cultural studies* 8 (2017): 500–31, <https://link.springer.com/content/pdf/10.1057%2Fs41280-017-0072-0.pdf>. The bibliography was published before Geraldine Heng’s essential *The Invention of Race in the European Middle Ages* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2018).

4. “Medieval and Renaissance Music Conference - MedRen 2018,” Events, Maynooth University Department of Music, accessed November 10, 2020, <https://www.maynoothuniversity.ie/music/events/medieval-and-renaissance-music-conference-medren-2018>.

5. The presentations were: Brandi A. Neal, “‘An Ounce of Prevention is Worth a Pound of Cure’: Shielding Early Music from the Alt-Right”; Elizabeth Randell Upton, “Music, Medievalism and White Supremacy: Anti-Racist Pedagogy after Charlottesville”; and Samantha Bassler, “Music, Disability and a Twenty-First Century Pedagogy of Medieval and Renaissance Culture.”

early modern period. Most discussions of diversity in musicology have focused on the nineteenth and twentieth centuries where there is more surviving evidence, and many of the efforts toward diversification and decolonization in teaching reject the idea of a survey altogether, often marginalizing those periods that are not part of the performing repertory of most undergraduate students. While early music is getting more attention in conversations around diversity and global history, and scholars of early music are speaking more strongly about these issues, these efforts have needed time to reach critical mass. Inspired by these conferences and related conversations in the aftermath of Charlottesville, I began to rethink my own teaching of early music, particularly in the context of the first half of our one-year survey for music majors. Writing women, Jews, and people of color back into the narrative has expanded the content of the course. This required paying more attention to non-notated music alongside notated, as well as shifting some of the focus away from composers toward performers (past and present), patrons, and scribes. It also begins to show medieval and early modern Europe as part of a global network, where Europe was sometimes an intellectual backwater and sometimes a colonial power. The result has been a fuller and more accurate picture of the past, one that simultaneously provides a closer connection to the lived experience of current students. My hope here is that, by outlining my own ongoing journey, I can provide others with some tools for their own and continue the growing conversation about diversity in early music.

To Survey Or Not To Survey?

The traditional survey of music before c. 1750 focuses almost entirely on white Christian men, with only a handful of exceptions. Several women composers from medieval and early modern Europe have become part of the pedagogical canon in recent years and are included in standard textbooks and anthologies, including Hildegard of Bingen, the Comtessa de Dia, Barbara Strozzi, and Elisabeth-Claude Jacquet de la Guerre. The Italian Jew Salamone Rossi is occasionally mentioned in passing in textbooks, and one of his sonatas appears in the anthology accompanying the Wright-Simms text.⁶ Based on what I have seen, none of the standard textbook materials currently names a musician of color active before the late eighteenth century.

6. Timothy Roden, Craig Wright, and Bryan Simms, eds., *Anthology for Music in Western Civilization* (Belmont, CA: Thomson Schirmer, 2006).

One could take this as yet another reason to eliminate the survey altogether, as some have done.⁷ I am one of those, however, who still believes in the value of a skeletal framework of Western art music for undergraduate music majors, even while we also try to show its limits. While I'm perfectly ready to question the canon and all that it entails, including its colonialist legacy, I don't believe our students can join in or even fully understand those issues until and unless they have some idea of what that canon is. There are places within the curriculum where I will deliberately mix musics from different styles, times, and places, but I still believe a historical survey has a useful role.⁸ Including early music within that survey is to my mind valuable because it shows a world before the creation of the museum repertory, a time when nearly all music was effectively new music. Studying early music, then, can help unsettle the romantic attitudes that continue to resonate in our world, such as the composer as genius, the autonomous artwork, and originality and self-expression as the essential goals of art music. It can therefore further set the stage not only for an understanding of later music but also for problematizing the canon.⁹

This critical work can start at the beginning: in the first week, my students, like many, read a number of excerpts about music by ancient and late antique writers. I ask them not only to identify trends within what is written, but also to consider who and what is missing. As students realize that this seemingly

7. See, for instance, the contributions to the roundtable "The End of the Undergraduate Music History Sequence," first presented at the 2014 Annual Meeting of the American Musicological Society, then published in this *Journal* 5, no. 2 (2015), 46–76, as well as the roundtable session "What Constitutes 'Core' in the Conservatory Curriculum" at the virtual annual meeting of the American Musicological Society, November 7, 2020. John Spilker suggests what he calls a "survey-adjacent" approach, creating "case studies [that] integrate European art music of the distant past with U. S. music from the more recent past"; see "Adventures in 'Survey Adjacent' Music History Courses," *Musicology Now*, November 16, 2017, <https://musicology-now.org/adventures-in-survey-adjacent-music-history-courses/>.

8. Our one-year survey is preceded by a course conceived as a series of snapshots, putting side-by-side selected pieces from Western art music and non-Western cultures. In my own section of this course I have further experimented with "snapshots" of decades rather than works, mini-units where I can mix art and popular music by diverse creators and seek moments of intersection, and where we can explore broader issues such as music and social justice. I have been inspired in this regard by Andrew Dell'Antonio, who most recently described the curricular reconfigurations he and his colleagues at UT Austin have made at the roundtable session "What Constitutes 'Core' in the Conservatory Curriculum." I find this "bifocal" approach, combining open-topic courses with a survey, to create the best balance between sometimes competing needs.

9. This is a point David R. M. Irving also makes, to a different end, in "Rethinking Early Modern 'Western Art Music': A Global History Manifesto," *IMS Musicological Brainfood* 3, no. 1 (2019): 6–10, https://brainfood.musicology.org/pdfs/ims_brainfood_3_no1_2019.pdf. I have not, as Irving does, emphasized the extent to which early music arguably does not participate in "art music," but I may do so in the future.

neutral material consists of specific types of texts written by and for men of a certain social and intellectual class, they see from the outset some of the limits of the task we are undertaking. From that point, highlighting musicians who were women or people of color not only shows that those individuals existed in medieval and early modern Europe—even when their trace may be faint in the written record—but it brings their activities to life. It also sometimes shows their struggles.

Broadening the Field: Focus on Gender

A month before the “Unite the Right” rally, as it happens, Kira Thurman and Kristen Turner published a column in *Musicology Now* entitled, “Six Easy Ways to Immediately Address Racial and Gender Diversity in Your Music History Classroom.”¹⁰ Several of their suggestions relate mostly to later music, but the first three have clear relevance for early music:

1. “Be transparent.” As Thurman and Turner state at the outset, “the canon is dominated by European male composers,” and this is particularly true of composed music written down during the Middle Ages and early modern period. That is a reality that must be acknowledged, even while we push against it. Indeed, being honest with our students about our choices, whatever they are, may be the most important thing we all can do.
2. “Consider the concept vs. the composer.” This is the place to ask whether a woman or a person of color can replace a white man. Elisabeth-Claude Jacquet de la Guerre has effectively replaced the Couperins in the Norton Anthology and elsewhere, for instance. Hildegard of Bingen, the Comtessa de Dia, and Barbara Strozzi are similarly present in all the currently available anthologies, not replacing men but appearing beside them.¹¹
3. “Play canonical composers—but use a recording featuring a musician of color or a woman musician.” This is a particularly easy fix for us all. My personal recording of the trope *Gaudeamus omnes*,

10. Kira Thurman and Kristen Turner, “Six Easy Ways to Immediately Address Racial and Gender Diversity in Your Music History Classroom,” *Musicology Now*, July 17, 2017, <https://musicologynow.org/six-easy-ways-to-immediately-address-racial-and-gender-diversity-in-your-music-history-classroom/>. The other three are “Let diverse voices speak,” “Think local,” and “Think of the present.”

11. A useful resource here is “Music Theory Examples by Women,” accessed November 10, 2020, <https://musictheoryexamplesbywomen.com/>. This site includes a few pre-Baroque composers and a few from the Baroque, but its primary focus is later.

on the Christmas introit *Puer natus est*, is by the Ensemble Gilles Binchois and features female singers; when I use it, I almost invariably get a question about whether women could sing this music in the Middle Ages.¹² My recording of Monteverdi's *Poppea* features the African-American Dana Hanchard as Nerone, and I regularly use a video of the opera's final duet "Pur ti miro" featuring the countertenor Philippe Jaroussky as Nerone and Danielle De Niese as Poppea.¹³ My initial goal in using this video was to have students see Nerone's treble voice coming out of a male body, but seeing a soprano of Sri Lankan heritage makes its own point.

As useful as it is to show diverse performers in the present, however, we also need to look more carefully at the past. Both literary and documentary evidence survives of women musicians and entertainers in the Middle Ages,¹⁴ as well as images of women—real, fictional, and allegorical—making music.¹⁵ We may not always be able to retrieve the sounds those women made, because they were not written down, but one of the major themes of this journey has been that marginalized populations in medieval and early modern Europe often appear in the margins, as it were, of the written record. That means that our normative pedagogical focus on the composer and on notated music gives us

12. The recording is Ensemble Gilles Binchois, dir. Dominique Vellard, *Les premières polyphonies françaises: organa et tropes du XIe siècle* (Virgin Veritas 45135, 1994). Of course women could sing chant and other sacred music, but only in a convent setting. I usually do not underline that women are singing myself, preferring to let students come up with the question—a more active approach.

13. The recording is John Eliot Gardiner, dir., *Monteverdi: L'incoronazione di Poppea* (Archiv 447 088-2AH3, 1996). The video, from a performance at the Teatro Real, Madrid, in 2010, can be found at Monteverdi: L'incoronazione di Poppea "Pur ti miro, Pur ti godo" (Jaroussky, De Niese), *YouTube*, February 21, 2012, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=_isL0E-4TsQ.

14. For example, Christopher Page discusses a set of ordinances for minstrels produced in 1321 in *The Owl and the Nightingale: Musical Life and Ideas in France 1100–1300* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1990), 61ff. More recently, Carol Symes has noted that the constitutions of the Confraternity of Our Lady of the Burning Ones, also known as the Brotherhood of Jongleurs and Townspeople, speaks of both men and women as members; see "The 'School of Arras' and the Career of Adam," *Musical Culture in the World of Adam de la Halle*, ed. Jennifer Saltzstein, (Leiden: Brill, 2019), 35. Brianna Dolce has used these same constitutions as a "witness to women's musical activity in the region" (308) in "Soit hom u feme': New Evidence for Women Musicians and the Search for the 'Women Trouvères,'" *Revue de Musicologie* 106, no. 2 (September 2020): 301–27. She also uses the contrafacture practice of the thirteenth-century mystic Hadewijch to suggest networks of poets and musicians, including women, between Arras and the Dutch-speaking areas of Brabant and Flanders.

15. A useful approach to thinking about women in medieval and early modern music is Cynthia J. Cyrus and Olivia Carter Mather, "Rereading Absence: Women in Medieval and Early Modern Music," *College Music Symposium* 38 (October 1, 1998), <https://symposium.music.org/index.php/38/item/2149-rereading-absence-women-in-medieval-and-renaissance-music>.

an incomplete picture of the musical world, and we therefore need to give more space in our surveys to unwritten musics. Even those of us who frequently use notation as a valuable tool to understanding developments in early music can often do more to acknowledge and make better use of both surviving hints about what does not get written down and the interpretive decisions that are involved in recreating what does.

While texts of several women troubadours exist, “A chantar” by the Comtessa de Dia is the only song by any *trobairitz* to survive with a melody. That melody appears in only one source, without attribution, and incompletely copied with only one stanza of text. Teaching this song alone can be seen as a tokenizing gesture, but it can be valuable to pair it, as anthologies often do, with Bernart de Ventadorn’s “Can vei la lauzeta mover,” one of the most widely transmitted of troubadour songs. When we consider the two together, we see how fragile and open notation is at this point: not only are all the manuscript sources considerably later than the songs themselves, there are extensive variants between the notated versions of Bernart’s song (one of which is actually attributed to Peire Vidal), which tells us that neither the texts nor the melodies of such songs were as fixed as we might expect.¹⁶ The notation used for both songs, moreover, provides only pitches and words, leaving many interpretive decisions (starting with rhythm) up to the performer—who likely would not have been using notation in any case. Teaching both songs together opens up the spectrum of what we can and cannot know about troubadours and their songs, and it can foreground the challenges in performing that music today.

Women religious left more compositional evidence. The chant of the twelfth-century visionary Hildegard of Bingen has entered the pedagogical canon, though it should be remembered that it was compiled with her other work as part of a canonization campaign—in other words, not with other chant, which would be transmitted anonymously. That unique purpose for writing down her chant is the only reason we can attach her name to it. Because Hildegard was working centuries after the first surviving traces of “Gregorian” chant, she cannot effectively replace that earlier (anonymous) repertory, but she can remind us, and our students, that both men and women sang chant through the Middle Ages and beyond, and surely composed it as well. She can

16. Simon Gaunt discusses textual variants in “Discourse Desired: Desire, Subjectivity, and *Mouvance* in *Can vei la lauzeta mover*,” in *Desiring Discourse: The Literature of Love, Ovid through Chaucer*, ed. James J. Paxson and Cynthia A. Gravlee (Selinsgrove: Susquehanna University Press and London: Associated University Presses, 1998), 89–110.

also provide great examples of eleventh-century German chant for those who have time to consider the post-Carolingian expansion of chant.¹⁷

Thirteenth-century polyphony in the style of the Notre Dame school survives in fragments from the Convent of Poor Clares of Sary Sącz in Poland, and the early-fourteenth-century Las Huelgas codex was copied and still remains in the Cistercian convent of Santa María la Real de Las Huelgas in Burgos, Spain.¹⁸ Again, we do not know who composed most of the music in these sources,¹⁹ but it is likely that at least some pieces were created by members of those houses, and in any case those nuns surely sang the music. Even though anthologies, and therefore courses, tend to focus attention on the compositional innovations of the two-part organum of Leonin and his contemporaries as transmitted in the central Notre Dame manuscripts, these sources can show that this style extended across Europe, not only to cathedrals and major Benedictine monasteries, but also to some of the wealthier women's houses, even those associated with more austere orders.

Nuns, as well as lay women, became more important as composers in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, as Craig Monson, Robert Kendrick, Laurie Stras, and others have shown.²⁰ Some of their music may be able to replace

17. On Hildegard's chant in its eleventh-century German context, see for instance Jennifer Bain, "Hildegard, Hermannus, and Late Chant Style," *Journal of Music Theory* 52, no. 1 (Spring 2008): 123–49. Bain further traces Hildegard's afterlife in *Hildegard of Bingen and Musical Reception: The Modern Revival of a Medieval Composer* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015). There she demonstrates, among other things, that Hildegard was "never truly a forgotten figure" (35), and she shows the different patterns of attention between nineteenth- and early-twentieth-century Germany and late-twentieth-century England and North America.

18. On the Sary Sącz fragments, see Mirosław Perz, "The Oldest Source of Polyphonic Music in Poland: Fragments from Sary Sącz," *Polish Musicological Studies I*, ed. Zofia Chechlińska and Jan Sześzewski (Kraków: Polskie Wydawnictwo Muzyczne, 1978), 9–57, and more recently Katarzyna Grochowska, "Tenor Circles and Motet Cycles: A Study of the Sary Sącz Manuscript [Pl-SS Muz 9] and its Implication for Modes of Repertory Organization in 13th-Century Polyphonic Collections" (Ph. D. dissertation, University of Chicago, 2013). Among the most recent studies of the Las Huelgas Codex are David Catalunya, "Nuns, Polyphony, and a Liégeois Cantor: New Light on the Las Huelgas 'Solmization Song,'" *Journal of the Alamire Foundation* 9, no. 1 (Spring 2017): 89–133, and David Catalunya, "The Customary of the Royal Convent of Las Huelgas of Burgos: Female Liturgy, Female Scribes," *Medievalia: Revista d'estudis medievals* 20, no. 1 (2017): 91–160.

19. One of the Sary Sącz fragments transmits a sequence by Philip the Chancellor, and the Las Huelgas codex includes one piece attributed to Perotin, but the other pieces are anonymous. I rely here on DIAMM, the Digital Archive of Medieval Music, accessed August 12, 2020, <https://www.diamm.ac.uk/>.

20. The literature here is vast and growing. Early landmarks are Craig Monson, *Disembodied Voices: Music and Culture in an Early Modern Italian Convent* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995), and Robert Kendrick, *Celestial Sirens: Nuns and their Music in Early Modern Milan* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1996). Laurie Stras, *Women and Music in Sixteenth-Century Ferrara* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2018), includes both the

pieces in the primary narrative of the course. Stras's work on Ferrara considers not only the compositional evidence for nun composers, but also places them within the wider context of women's music-making both in the convent and at court, beginning with Isabella d'Este, herself a singer.²¹ A marvelous video directed by Anne MacNeil shows Isabella's music room or *grotta* and discusses her patronage of the frottola.²² Focusing on Isabella allows us to present the frottola as an important cultural moment in its own right, not only as a way station to the compositional achievement of the madrigal. Stras also puts the virtuoso singers of the *musica secreta* or *concerto delle donne* into a broader Ferrarese context.

Continuing with female singers leads us to the Florentine *intermedi* and the beginnings of opera, where the intersections between seventeenth- and eighteenth-century divas and castrati and the singers who inhabit their roles today allow a class to consider gender issues in both past and present.²³ Female singers and instrumentalists also appear at the Pio Ospedale della Pietà in Venice, for which many of Antonio Vivaldi's concertos were likely written.²⁴ And behind the scenes, Maria Cavalli, like Anna Magdalena Bach, had an active role in copying her husband's work, while in the sixteenth century Katharina vom Berg managed the Berg and Neuber publishing firm for decades after her husband's death.²⁵ All these activities may fall below the compositional radar, but they are

virtuoso court singers of the *Musica Secreta* (*Concerto delle Donne*) of Alfonso II d'Este and the music of Alfonso's aunt, the nun Leonora d'Este. Stras has also contributed to this field through her recordings as co-director of the ensembles *Musica Secreta* and *Celestial Sirens*, including *Lucrezia Borgia's Daughter* (Obsidian CD717, 2017).

21. Others have worked on Isabella, most notably William F. Prizer, in "Isabella d'Este and Lucrezia Borgia as Patrons of Music: The Frottola at Mantua and Ferrara," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 38, no. 1 (Spring 1985): 1–33, and "Una 'virtù molto conveniente a Madonne': Isabella d'Este as a Musician," *Journal of Musicology* 17, no. 1 (Winter 1999): 10–49.

22. Video available at <http://ideamusic.web.unc.edu/ad-tempo-taci/>. The IDEA site has a wealth of materials on Isabella and the frottola; a good starting point for students, in addition to the video, is Anne MacNeil, "Isabella d'Este and Music," *IDEA: Isabella d'Este Archive*, December 1, 2017, <http://ideamusic.web.unc.edu/isabella-deste-music/>. Isabella's *grotta* is decorated with an *impresa*, reproduced on that page, that features rests and mensuration signs, and MacNeil notes that one cabinet has an engraving of a rondeau by Johannes Ockeghem.

23. Again, the literature on castrati in particular is vast. Useful starting points may be Giuseppe Gerbino, "The Quest for the Soprano Voice: Castrati in Renaissance Italy," *Studi musicali* 33, no. 2 (2004): 303–57, and Roger Freitas, "The Eroticism of Emasculation: Confronting the Baroque Body of the Castrato," *Journal of Musicology* 20, no. 2 (Spring 2003): 196–249.

24. Ellen Rosand discusses this in "Vivaldi's Stage," *The Journal of Musicology* 18, no. 1 (Winter 2001): 8–30.

25. Christine Jeanneret, "Maria Cavalli: In the Shadow of Francesco," in *Readying Cavalli's Operas for the Stage: Manuscript, Edition, Production*, ed. Ellen Rosand (Farnham: Ashgate, 2013), 95–117, and Susan Jackson, "Who is Katherine? The Women of the Berg

essential for music-making, and women have a significant role in these areas.²⁶

Broadening the Field: Focus on Race, Ethnicity, and Religion

People of color are harder to find. It is worth remembering, though, that the Roman Empire circled the Mediterranean basin, which means that people moved freely between Europe, North Africa, and the Middle East throughout antiquity and late antiquity. Many of us use that marvelous passage in Augustine's *Confessions* about the power of music—but we may not inform our students that Augustine was a Berber, born in what is now Algeria, and that, after about five years in Italy, he returned to Africa, becoming bishop of Hippo Regius, now the Algerian city of Annaba.²⁷ Many of the Church Fathers whose writings are excerpted in source readings collections came from the Middle East, including Basil of Caesarea (in modern Israel) and John Chrysostom (born in Antioch, later Patriarch of Constantinople). Jerome came from Dalmatia, in modern Croatia, and died in Bethlehem.

Even after the Roman Empire crumbled, contact continued across the Mediterranean and beyond. A man named Hadrian, for instance, identified as “natione affricanus” (African by birth) in a *Life* by the eleventh-century Benedictine Goscelin of Saint-Bertin, was sent by Pope Vitalian to England in 668 along with Theodore of Tarsus, the newly named Archbishop of Canterbury (himself a native of what is now Turkey).²⁸ Hadrian became abbot of the monastery of Saints Peter and Paul in Canterbury, where he would of

& Neuber—Gerlach—Kaufmann Printing Dynasty,” *Yearbook of the Alamire Foundation* 2 (1997): 451–63.

26. Including areas of music-making beyond composition and performance resonates with the idea of an art world defined by Howard Becker as the “network of people whose cooperative activity” is necessary to produce a work of art. Becker’s work focuses on “patterns of cooperation among the people who make the works” rather than on “the works themselves” or “those conventionally defined as their creators”; Howard S. Becker, *Art Worlds* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982), ix, x.

27. The relevant passage from book 10, chapter 33 of the *Confessions* is translated by James McKinnon in James S. McKinnon, ed., *The Early Christian Period and the Latin Middle Ages*, vol. 2 of *Strunk’s Source Readings in Music History*, rev. ed., Leo Treitler, gen. ed. (New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 1998), 22–23. The other authors named in this paragraph also have excerpts in that volume.

28. On Hadrian, see Alison Hudson, “An African Abbot in Anglo-Saxon England,” *Medieval Manuscripts Blog* (October 27, 2016), <https://blogs.bl.uk/digitisedmanuscripts/2016/10/an-african-abbot-in-anglo-saxon-england.html>. Gregory of Tours also writes about a group of Frankish diplomats who stopped in Carthage on their way to Byzantium in the 590s—the so-called Frankish layover in Carthage—that included a brawl with locals; Sihong Lin discusses this in “The Mystery of Stephen the

course have participated in the Daily Office.²⁹ Both Hadrian and Theodore may have been refugees from the Muslim expansion, which was finally turned back in the West by Charles Martel (Charlemagne's grandfather) at the battle of Tours (or Poitiers) in 732, but the Umayyad dynasty ruled most of the Iberian peninsula into the eleventh century, and Muslim rule was not eliminated from Spain until 1492—the year Jews were also expelled from the kingdom. That, of course, was also the year Cristoforo Colombo landed in the Americas, marking a significant new stage in European colonialism. During the intervening centuries, poet-composers such as Thibaut de Champagne and other musicians were among those Europeans who went to the Middle East on Crusade, though it is unclear how much native music they would have encountered on those journeys.

The rapid spread of Islam made the Iberian Peninsula a center of cross-Mediterranean contacts. Aristotle's works, largely unavailable to early medieval Europe, came to Paris and other European intellectual centers in the twelfth century, largely through translations from Arabic texts.³⁰ Instruments such as the lute likewise seem to come into Western Europe through the Iberian peninsula.³¹ Surviving texts of medieval song in Arabic, Hebrew, and Iberian Romance languages such as Galician-Portuguese show some structural similarities, and it seems reasonable to speculate that each had some interaction not only with each other but also with non-notated indigenous traditions that predate the Islamic invasions.³² The medieval Andalusian *zajal* and *muwashshah* were not

African," *The Public Medievalist* (May 2, 2017), <https://www.publicmedievalist.com/mystery-stephen-african/>. Lin further reports that Roger Collins has argued that Isidore of Seville may have been from North Africa.

29. The monastery is better known as St. Augustine's. According to George Cyprian Alston, the abbey was dedicated to Peter and Paul on its founding in 605, but after later expansion it was rededicated to Peter, Paul, and Augustine of Canterbury by Dunstan, then archbishop of Canterbury, in 978. "Abbey of Saint Augustine," *The Catholic Encyclopedia*, vol. 13 (New York: Robert Appleton Company, 1912), available online at New Advent, <http://www.newadvent.org/cathen/13333a.htm>.

30. Bernard G. Dod, "Aristoteles latinus," chapter 2 of *The Cambridge History of Later Medieval Philosophy: From the Rediscovery of Aristotle to the Disintegration of Scholasticism, 1100–1600*, ed. Norman Kretzman et al. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), 45–79. As Dod shows, Byzantine sources were also important.

31. See Klaus Wachsmann, et al., "Lute," *Grove Music Online*, January 20, 2001, <https://doi.org/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.40074>. The "History" section of the article, by Ian Harwood and Diana Poulton, revised by David van Edwards, notes further influence from Arabic musicians through Sicily to German lute makers in the thirteenth century.

32. María Rosa Menocal makes a compelling circumstantial case for influence on the textual side in *The Arabic Role in Medieval Literary History: A Forgotten Heritage* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1987). See also Manuel Pedro Ferreira, "Rondeau and Virelai: The Music of Andalus and the Cantigas de Santa Maria," *Plainsong and Medieval Music* 13, no. 2 (2004): 127–40.

notated, so the ensemble Altramar combined medieval texts and descriptions of performances with existing oral traditions from northern Africa for its two *Iberian Garden* recordings.³³

The *Cantigas de Santa Maria*, examples of which are included in all the major anthologies, can also be used to provide a window on this diverse Iberian world, though it must be acknowledged that the modern ideal of “convivencia” between Islamic, Christian, and Jewish societies at the court of Alfonso the Wise (1221–84), king of Castile, León, and Galicia, does not always align with the more complex evidence of both coexistence and conflict.³⁴ Because modern performances of cantigas tend to be heavily influenced by the sounds of modern middle eastern and north African music, I sometimes assign students John Haines’ article on “The Arabic Style of Performing Early Music,”³⁵ which reinforces the point made earlier about the openness to interpretation of the notation of medieval song.

Substantial communities of Jews existed across Europe in the Middle Ages, though their presence was not always welcome. For instance, Philip II Augustus, king of France, expelled all Jews from the territories he directly controlled in 1182, and some French lords did likewise over the course of the thirteenth century, though there was no large-scale expulsion in France until 1306.³⁶ A collection of French and Hebrew songs from the Jewish community of northern France in the second half of the thirteenth century survives in a manuscript now at the British Library. This source does not include notation,

33. Altramar, *Iberian Garden: Jewish, Christian, and Muslim Music in Medieval Spain*, vol. 1 (Dorian Discovery DIS-80151, 1997) and vol. 2 (Dorian Discovery DIS-80158, 1998).

34. Karen Cook’s essay on the *Cantigas de Santa Maria* in the A-R Online Anthology (<https://www.armusicanthology.com/>) does a good job of balancing these points for students. For a more negative view, see Ian Pittaway, “Infidels, ‘Traitors’ and ‘That Ugly Bearded Crew’: Fear and Loathing in the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*,” *Early Music Muse* (May 22, 2018), <https://earlymusicmuse.com/infidels-cantigas/>. See also Maya Soifer, “Beyond *convivencia*: Critical Reflections on the Historiography of Interfaith Relations in Christian Spain,” *Journal of Medieval Iberian Studies* 1, no. 1 (January 2009): 19–35.

35. John Haines, “The Arabic Style of Performing Early Music,” *Early Music* 29, no. 3 (August 2001): 369–78. Kristin Yri argues that Haines’ discussion of Binkley’s work in terms of orientalism is misplaced, rather concluding that the performances of the *Studio der Frühen Musik* “may be read as challenging colonialist attitudes that insisted on a West-East dichotomy” (279); see “Thomas Binkley and the *Studio der Frühen Musik*: Challenging ‘the Myth of Westernness,’” *Early Music* 38, no. 2 (May 2010): 273–80. Jonathan Shull discusses the more recent work on the *Cantigas de Santa Maria* by Joel Cohen and the *Camerata Mediterranea*, inspired by Cohen’s work with the *Abdelkrim Rais Andalusian Orchestra of Fès*, in “Locating the Past in the Present: Living Traditions and the Performance of Early Music,” *Ethnomusicology Forum* 15, no. 1 (June 2006): 87–111, especially 98–99.

36. Even then, Louis X had to let the Jews return in 1315. For an introduction to these events and the financial and political reasons behind them, see William Chester Jordan, “Jews, Regalian Rights, and the Constitution in Medieval France,” *AJS Review* 23, no. 1 (1998): 1–16.

but the rubrics for two texts name the trouvère song whose melody should be used; the members of the Ensemble Alla francesca used these two melodies and fit others to surviving poems to create their recording *Juifs et trouvères*.³⁷

Instead of replacing more commonly-taught pieces with one of these, I use them to expand the field of monophonic song beyond what there is usually time to include. Following up on full-class discussion of issues of creation, transmission, and performance, using Bernart de Ventadorn's *Can vei la lauzeta mover* and the Comtessa de Dia's *A chantar*, and the Cantigas de Santa Maria, I assign small groups other examples to study: the Hebrew and Andalusian songs mentioned above, Latin conductus, Minnesang, *cantigas de amigo*, and laude, as well as songs by troubadours and trouvères. In this context, these all become equally valid and valued forms of song. The work of the class as a whole not only serves to represent women and people of color as creators of medieval song, it also challenges misleading ideas of musical transmission by providing examples of a wide range of possibilities for notation and performance, both in the Middle Ages and in our own time.

The combination of full-class and small-group work allows for a picture of medieval monophonic song that is both geographically wider and more diverse. Similarly, I have assigned to small groups pieces of sixteenth-century sacred music by Cristóbal de Morales and Francisco Guerrero that appear in North American colonial sources, a motet by the Portuguese Vicente Lusitano, who is called “pardo” (of mixed blood) in a seventeenth-century source,³⁸ and Hebrew-texted music by the Italian Jew Salamone Rossi, alongside sacred music by William Byrd, Adrian Willaert, and others.

Sixteenth-century England also gives us a rare example of a named musician of African heritage—John Blanke, trumpeter at the court of Henry VIII. Blanke is even depicted on the 60-foot-long Westminster Tournament Roll, which commemorates the 1511 celebrations of the birth of a son to Henry VIII and Catherine of Aragon.³⁹ (That baby, unfortunately, died shortly thereafter.)

37. *Juifs et trouvères: Chansons juives du XIIIe siècle en ancien français et hébreu*, Collection Patrimoines Musicaux des Juifs de France (Buda Musique 860261, 2014). I am grateful to Luisa Nardini for sharing information about this recording. Ensemble Alla francesca's main text source is London, British Library, Add. MS 11639, (“The Northern French Miscellany,” copied 1277–1324). For more information on their process of selection and adaptation, see Anne Ibos-Augé, Brigitte Lesne, and Colette Sirat, “Du texte à la musique: Enjeux d'une reconstruction mélodique. Juifs et trouvères—Chansons juives du XIIIe siècle en ancien français et en hébreu,” in *Philologie et musicologie: Des sources à l'interprétation poético-musical (12e-16e siècle)*, ed. Christelle Chaillou-Amadiéu, et al., *Musicologie* 8 (Paris: Classiques Garnier, 2019), 29–47.

38. Robert Stevenson, “The First Black Published Composer,” *Inter-American Music Review* 5, no. 1 (Fall 1982): 79–103, citing a manuscript by João Franco Barreto (80).

39. This is held at the College of Arms in London; a reproduction of the relevant section of the Roll can be found at “An Evening with John Blanke,” College of Arms, November 10, 2017, <https://>

Miranda Kaufmann's book *Black Tudors* presents and contextualizes a number of documents referring to Blanke in her first case study—an accessible reading for students.⁴⁰ Arne Spohr's recent work on Black court musicians in early modern German states focuses on the seventeenth-century trumpeters Christian Real and Christian Gottlieb. Spohr demonstrates that attitudes toward these musicians of African birth were ambivalent, and that their social and legal status was sometimes complicated.⁴¹ At court, they were valued but also exotized, and when they left the court for the town, they might find themselves the victims of discrimination and even physical danger.

John Blanke, Christian Real, Christian Gottlieb, and their often-anonymous colleagues not only show us that Black musicians existed, but they also remind us of the non-notated music they played. Although we necessarily spend much of our time focusing on the written traditions of polyphonic music, both monophony and music that was orally transmitted and/or improvised still made up much of most ordinary peoples' daily musical experiences, even in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. Resources such as YouTube are full of reenactments and other materials that, while necessarily speculative and sometimes problematic, can at least shed some light on earlier practices and open space for questions and discussion.

Colonization and the Jesuits

The history of the early modern period is shaped not only by developments within Europe, but also by colonization. Music was a useful tool for many groups of colonizers, but perhaps for none so strongly as for the Society of Jesus. Because I teach at a Jesuit university, it is a particularly natural move to consider the use of music in Jesuit missions. The available literature is growing, but I have found especially useful a pair of essays that allow a comparison between the ways music is used to teach Christian doctrine in Brazil and Japan.⁴² In Brazil, sacred texts translated into local languages were initially set to both European

www.college-of-arms.gov.uk/news-grants/news/item/149-an-evening-with-john-blanke.

40. Miranda Kaufmann, *Black Tudors: The Untold Story* (London: Oneworld Publications, 2017).

41. Arne Spohr, "Mohr und Trompeter': Blackness and Social Status in Early Modern Germany" *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 72, no. 3 (Fall 2019): 613–63.

42. Paolo Castagna, "The Use of Music by the Jesuits in the Conversion of the Indigenous Peoples of Brazil," in *The Jesuits: Cultures, Sciences, and the Arts, 1540–1773*, ed. John W. O'Malley, et al. (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1999), 641–58, and Makoto Harris Takao, "In their Own Way': Contrafactual Practice in Japanese Christian Communities during the 16th Century," *Early Music* 47, no. 2 (May 2019): 183–98.

and local melodies, but the bishop complained about the use of native music, so soon only European melodies were used. Native music was used much more freely in the Japanese missions, surely in part reflecting Japan's identity as an independent state rather than a colony like Brazil. Moreover, Jesuit attitudes were shaped by the hierarchical classification of civilizations articulated by the sixteenth-century Jesuit José de Acosta, who put Japan and China at the highest tier, because of their "highly organised system of public administration, a legal order rooted in culture, and a well-developed literary tradition."⁴³ This implicit bias may account for the apparent acquiescence of the Brazilian Jesuits to the bishop's prohibition of the use of indigenous music in the missions.

Another Jesuit worth attention is Joseph-Marie Amiot, who spent most of his life in China, remaining even after the suppression of the Jesuit order in 1773. While there he served as translator for the Chinese emperor, and he compiled a French-Manchu dictionary. Among his many writings on Chinese culture is *Mémoire sur la musique des chinois tant anciens que modernes*, published in Paris in 1779 with "notes and observations" by Pierre-Joseph Roussier, a theorist who edited Amiot's work with a heavy hand—Stewart Carter goes so far as to call Roussier "the editor from Hell."⁴⁴ Carter's essay shows how Roussier both imposed his own theories on Amiot's text and simplified it with an eye toward his French readers. This shows both the interest in Chinese music in France and the levels of misunderstanding about it. Amiot also compiled a collection of Christian sacred music with Chinese texts and a collection of *Divertissements chinois*, both written in Chinese characters placed on a western staff; some of this music has been recorded, which allows for discussion of the interpretive decisions made by the performers and questions of cultural appropriation.⁴⁵

43. See Tomasz Jeż, "The Global Mission in the Music of Jesuit Drama," in *Studies on a Global Music History: A Balzan Musicology Project*, ed. Reinhard Strohm (Abingdon, Oxfordshire, UK: Routledge, 2018): 335. David R. M. Irving also distinguishes between the use of music in colonies in Latin America and elsewhere, on the one hand, and in autonomous territories such as Japan and China, on the other, in "Music in Global Jesuit Missions, 1540–1773," in *The Oxford Handbook of the Jesuits*, ed. Ines G. Županov (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019), 598–634.

44. Stewart Carter, "The Editor from Hell: Information and Misinformation on Chinese Music in Late Eighteenth-Century France," in *Music in Eighteenth-Century Culture*, ed. Mary Sue Morrow (Ann Arbor: Steglein Publishing, 2016), 23–47.

45. The manuscript is Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale de France, MS Bréquigny 14, available at "Mélanges sur la Chine et les Chinois," Gallica, accessed November 28, 2020, <https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/btv1b54100660g>. François Picard has studied the manuscript and edited the *Divertissements chinois* in "Amiot, Les Divertissements chinois," August 30, 2012, <https://halshs.archives-ouvertes.fr/halshs-00726594>. The sacred music is edited in François Picard and Pierre Marsone, "Le cahier de Musique sacrée du père Amiot, un recueil de prières chantées en chinois du XVIIIe siècle," *Sanjiao wenxian: Matériaux pour l'étude de la religion chinoise* 3 (1999): 13–72, <https://halshs.archives-ouvertes.fr/halshs-01246794v2>.

Interest in the wider world in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries was not limited to European missionaries abroad, as the publication of Amiot's work in France shows. It is common to consider orientalism when teaching operas from the nineteenth century, but forms of exoticism are worth acknowledging when teaching baroque musical theatre as well.⁴⁶ The fifth-act masque of Henry Purcell's *Fairy Queen* includes a Chinese Man and Woman, as well as a "Monkey's Dance," while Jean-Philippe Rameau's *Les indes galantes* has entrées set in imagined versions of Turkey, Peru, Persia, and North America. There is little or no musical exoticism in either piece, but it can be fruitful to pair them with their more frequently anthologized counterparts (Purcell's *Dido and Aeneas* and Jean-Baptiste Lully's *Armide*) and discuss with students both the popularity at the time of characters and settings from Asia or North America and the apparent lack of interest in those musics.⁴⁷ This can also set the stage for nineteenth-century opera and other works where musical orientalism becomes more apparent.

The first half of most yearlong surveys ends with Johann Sebastian Bach and George Frideric Handel, powerhouses of the traditional canon. Michael Marissen has shown anti-Jewish elements in the work of both composers, and Bach's *Schauet doch und sehet*, BWV 46, can easily replace the more commonly anthologized cantatas, allowing discussion of the Lutheran theological idea that the destruction of the Temple in Jerusalem was punishment for the rejection of Christ by first-century Jews.⁴⁸ For Handel, I draw on David Hunter's work on Handel's investments in the Royal African Company.⁴⁹ Because I focus on

46. A useful resource here is Ralph P. Locke, *Music and the Exotic from the Renaissance to Mozart* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015). I may also take advantage of Locke's work on Giovanni Kapsberger's *Apotheosis sive Consecratio SS. Ignatii et Francisci Xaverii*, "Exotic Elements in Kapsberger's Jesuit Opera (Rome, 1622) Honoring Saints Ignatius and Francis Xavier," in *Festschrift for Prof. Kerala J. Snyder*, ed. Johan Norrback and Joel Speerstra (2016), <http://hdl.handle.net/2077/54931>.

47. Frans and Julie Muller argue that the use of a Chinese garden reflects Queen Mary's collection of Chinese porcelain, and the masque as a whole celebrates the fifteenth wedding anniversary of William and Mary; see "Completing the Picture: The Importance of Reconstructing Early Opera," *Early Music* 33, no. 4 (November 2005): 667–81. Reinhard Strohm puts the Rameau into the context of utopian ethnography in "Les Sauvages, Music in Utopia, and the Decline of the Courtly Pastoral," *Il Saggiatore musicale* 11, no. 1 (2004): 21–50. The Opéra de Paris performed *Les Indes galantes* in September–October 2019 in a production directed by Clément Cogitore, who two years earlier had created a short film of the *Danse du grand calumet de la paix* featuring a group of krump dancers. The film can be viewed at Opéra de Paris, accessed November 10, 2020, <https://www.operadeparis.fr/en/3e-scene/les-indes-galantes>.

48. Michael Marissen, "The Character and Sources of the Anti-Judaism in Bach's Cantata 46," *Harvard Theological Review* 96, no. 1 (January 2003): 63–99.

49. David Hunter, "Handel and the Royal African Company," *Musicology Now*, June 14, 2015, <https://musicologynow.org/handel-and-the-royal-african-company/>. Fuller information

Handel's response to market forces in the creation of the English oratorio, I have come to see Hunter's contribution as a necessary acknowledgement of how deeply embedded the slave trade was in the economy of the time. The end of the survey, then, not only focuses on two composers central to the traditional canon, it also situates them within, on the one hand, the long history of European anti-semitism, and on the other, the colonialist underpinnings of Western art music.

Most of this does not in fact seriously change the core of the narrative, nor does it remove Western art music from the center of the course. Some might condemn me for that. But, as I said at the outset, I think that basic skeleton has value, so my goal here is to extend from it more than to replace it entirely.

Concluding Thoughts

The history of European music in the Middle Ages and early modern period includes cross-Mediterranean contacts, colonial encounters, the persistent prejudice against Jews, women whose contributions are often invisible, and the economic entanglements of European colonialism and the transatlantic slave trade. Acknowledging this more complex story nudges the undergraduate survey away from its traditional emphasis on "great works," "great men," and style history, putting more emphasis on the musical world, where written music by named composers is only part of the picture. I will not claim to have achieved a "global history," nor to have "decolonized" my course—indeed, what I do here may serve more to uncover the colonialist underpinnings of Western art music than to decolonize it. Nevertheless, this approach may have value as a necessary first step, both toward acknowledging the past on which we stand and toward finding a way forward.

To me, this ongoing journey has been valuable not only for its own sake, but also because it serves to expand the focus to include not only composers but also performers, to pay attention to non-notated musical practice as well as the development of notation, and to explore the broad space between notation and sound that is central to early music. This wider scope allows students both to understand music of the past and to consider it within their own present.

I recognize that this kind of work can turn the added material into "tokens" that reinforces their uniqueness. I hope that I have alleviated this potential by putting these new pieces into dialogue with other pieces and shifting the focus toward musical communities. I have also tried to follow the advice of Hussein

appears in David Hunter, *The Lives of George Frideric Handel* (Woodbridge: The Boydell Press, 2015).

Fancy who, in a recent webinar on “Race, Racism, and the Middle Ages,” recommended that we show the work involved in adding this material to the course, so students can see the extent to which the traditional approach dominates our own training.⁵⁰ One of the difficulties of this process has been that the materials easily available to us too often reinforce the standard narrative, so expanding the field requires considerable work. We are at a turning point, however, where both materials and ideas about how to use them are becoming ever more widely shared. Even during the period of writing this article, new resources have become available, and my own journey is not done.

I sympathize with the criticism of “the imposition and dominance of Western Euro-American systems of knowledge,”⁵¹ and I acknowledge that the typical history survey does reflect a white racial frame,⁵² telling a story that is both Eurocentric and shaped by the age of colonialism. But I also question whether eliminating the survey actually serves to dismantle that frame. Perhaps maintaining that survey, especially the earlier stages of it, but expanding its scope can help show how music became entangled with colonialism, and how it reifies a white racial frame, which may in turn help us to dismantle it.

50. Hussein Fancy, “The Hidden Syllabus,” *Race, Racism, and Teaching the Middle Ages* (panel presentation), Medieval Academy of America, July 20, 2020, <https://www.medievalacademy.org/page/TeachingTheMiddleAgesWebinar>.

51. See for instance, David Chavannes and Maria Ryan, “Decolonizing the Music Survey: A Manifesto for Action,” David Chavannes (website), June 15, 2018, <http://www.dchavannes.com/read/2018/6/15/rygmnk175vgepbyn29p0zn0imr9r>.

52. See Philip A. Ewell, “Music Theory and the White Racial Frame,” *Music Theory Online* 26, no. 2 (September 2020), <https://mtosmt.org/issues/mto.20.26.2/mto.20.26.2.ewell.html>.

Appendix: Article Report Assignment

In recent years, I have often used an article report assignment to give students experience reading scholarly literature in music.⁵³ The list of articles from which students could choose in fall 2019 follows; nearly every item deals with women, gender, non-Europeans, or European Jews. Over half the articles were written by women, and a couple are by women of color. Just as Thurman and Turner noted the value of playing performances by women and musicians of color, having students read the work of a diverse group of scholars allows all students to see people who look like them engaging in a wide variety of musical practices and as creators of knowledge. This kind of assignment can be a first step toward expanding a traditional survey, because it operates in parallel to the in-class portion of the course.

Monophony:

Bain, Jennifer. "Hildegard, Hermannus, and Late Chant Style." *Journal of Music Theory* 52, no. 1 (Spring 2008): 123–49.

Cheyette, Frederic L., and Margaret Switten. "Women in Troubadour Song: of the Comtessa and the Vilana." *Women & Music: A Journal of Gender and Culture* 2 (1998): 26–46.

Ferreira, Manuel Pedro. "Rondeau and Virelai: The Music of Andalus and the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*." *Plainsong and Medieval Music* 13, no. 2 (2004): 127–40.

Shelemay, Kay Kauffman, Peter Jeffery, and Ingrid Monson. "Oral and Written Transmission in Ethiopic Christian Chant." *Early Music History* 12 (1993): 55–117.

Stoessel, Jason. "Voice and Song in Early Encounters between Latins, Mongols, and Persians, ca. 1250–ca. 1350." In *Studies on a Global*

53. I used a 3-2-1 assignment format: three important aspects, two aspects the student didn't understand, and one question the student has for the author. See Geraldine Van Gyn, "The Little Assignment with the Big Impact: Reading, Writing, Critical Reflection, and Meaningful Discussion," *Faculty Focus* (May 6, 2013), <https://www.facultyfocus.com/articles/course-design-ideas/the-little-assignment-with-the-big-impact-reading-writing-critical-reflection-and-meaningful-discussion/>. This is mostly an accountability measure and an opportunity for student reflection, so I didn't spend much time grading them. Students did at least three of these assignments, one for each of the four units, with the fourth report available for extra credit.

History of Music: A Balzan Musicology Project, ed, Reinhard Strohm, 83–113. Abingdon, UK: Routledge, 2018.

Polyphony to c. 1450:

Clark, Suzannah. “‘Sen dirai chançonete’: Hearing Text and Music in a Medieval Motet.” *Plainsong and Medieval Music* 16, no. 1 (2007): 31–59.

Leach, Elizabeth Eva. “Gendering the Semitone, Sexing the Leading Tone: Fourteenth-Century Music Theory and the Directed Progression.” *Music Theory Spectrum* 28, no. 1 (Spring 2006): 1–21.

Saltzstein, Jennifer. “Rape and Repentance in Two Medieval Motets.” *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 70, no. 3 (Fall 2017): 583–616.

c. 1450–c. 1600:

Kendall, G. Yvonne. “Ornamentation and Improvisation in Sixteenth-Century Dance.” In *Improvisation in the Arts of the Middle Ages and Renaissance, 170–90*. Edited by Timothy McGee. Kalamazoo: Medieval Institute Publications, 2003.

Montford, Kimberlyn. “Holy Restraint: Religious Reform and Nuns’ Music in Early Modern Rome.” *Sixteenth Century Journal* 37, no. 4 (Winter 2006): 1007–26.

Owens, Jessie Ann. “The Milan Partbooks: Evidence of Cipriano da Rore’s Compositional Process.” *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 37, no. 2 (Summer 1984): 270–98.

Prizer, William F. “Isabella d’Este and Lucrezia Borgia as Patrons of Music: The Frottola at Mantua and Ferrara.” *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 38, no. 1 (Spring 1985): 1–33.

Stras, Laurie. “*Voci pari* Motets and Convent Polyphony in the 1540s: The *materna lingua* Complex.” *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 70, no. 3 (2017): 617–96.

Baroque:

Adler, Israel. “The Rise of Art Music in the Italian Ghetto.” In *Jewish Medieval and Renaissance Studies*, 321–64. Edited by Alexander Altmann. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1967.

Austern, Linda Phyllis. “‘No pill’s gonna cure my ill’: Gender, Erotic Melancholy and Traditions of Musical Healing in the Modern West.” In

Musical Healing in Cultural Contexts, ed. Penelope Gouk, 113–36.
Aldershot: Ashgate, 2000.

Lam, Joseph S. C. “Music and Masculinities in Late Ming China.” *Asian Music* 42, no. 2 (Summer/Fall 2011): 112–34.

Rosand, Ellen. “Vivaldi’s Stage.” *Journal of Musicology* 18, no. 1 (Winter 2001): 8–30.

Stilwell, Kenneth. “Adopting Rituals: The Jesuits and the Huron Noël, ‘Jesus Ahatonnia.’” In *Music as Cultural Mission: Explorations of Jesuit Practices in Italy and North America*, 147–65. Edited by Anna Harwell Celenza and Anthony DelDonna. Early Modern Catholicism and the Visual Arts Series 9. Philadelphia: Saint Joseph’s University Press, 2014.

Object Lessons: Teaching Musicology Through Museum Collections

ELIZABETH A. CLENDINNING AND ANDREW W. GURSTELLE

The physical qualities of musical instruments are not usually the focus of music history education. However, non-sonic encounters with performance-related objects provide opportunities for students to connect music making with a range of historical, cultural, and social topics. The physical qualities of these objects—as diverse as banjos and balalaikas, nyckelharpas and nose flutes, shadow puppets and shekeres—inspire curiosity, which ideally motivate students to continue to respect, cherish, support, critique, and ultimately love and care for artistic practices and communities. Wonder is a feeling powerful enough to animate enjoyment for a lifetime.¹ Yet, Stephen Greenblatt cautions that wonder at the unfamiliar is a two-edged sword.² On the one hand, wonder can lead to feelings of resonance or sameness with cultural others, or foster cross-cultural experiences and creative, mutually beneficial hybridity. On the other hand, wonder, coupled with greed and fear, has motivated centuries of colonial appropriation and exploitation—the very impulses that educators in the twenty-first century work to combat. In musicology classroom settings, educators endeavor not only to spark wonder through encounters with “new” musics and cultures, but also to provide frameworks that help students ask questions, make connections, and work to respectfully represent and advocate for the artistic communities they study.

Facilitating student work with museum collections of musical instruments and other performance-related objects is one opportunity to cultivate students’ wonder and transform it into critical inquiry and respectful representation.³ This

1. For example, see accounts in Margaret Sarkissian and Theodore Solís, *Ethnomusicological Lives: Growing Up and Into a Profession* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2019).

2. Stephen Greenblatt, *Marvelous Possessions: The Wonder of the New World* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2017), 19ff.

3. In many cultures, music, dance, puppetry, and other performing arts are not separated conceptually. Here, we use “musical objects” and “performance-related objects” to refer generally to the wide array of item types integral to performance, whereas terminologies used for

article describes a collaboration between the authors—Elizabeth Clendinning is a professor of music and Andrew Gurstelle is director of a campus museum of anthropology—as we guided student research on musical objects culminating in the exhibit “Musical Narratives of the Southwest Pacific Rim.” This exhibit drew on materials in the museum’s collections and was experienced by over 3,000 visitors over six months. Most of these students had taken little or no prior music or anthropology coursework in college. Yet, for this final project, students learned how to select and examine the objects on display, including musical instruments, dance costumes and masks, and other performance-related objects; to research how the objects were used within their original historical and cultural settings; to write informative text panels; and to conceptualize and design thematic exhibit displays. In doing so, they not only fulfilled core cognitive learning objectives, but also developed feelings of respect, kinship, and deep affection for the objects and cultures that they had researched in the process.

In this article, we use our students’ work on the “Musical Narratives” exhibit as a case study to examine the strategies and benefits of a curation project. We begin with a brief discussion of the colonial origins of instrument collecting in the West and its relationship to the development of the modern musicological fields, highlighting why acknowledging and discussing the legacies of such histories can be a crucial method to decolonizing music history education. Subsequently, we describe contemporary scholarly approaches to considering the lives of musical instruments, all of which can animate discussions and project design within the undergraduate classroom.⁴ We then discuss how to design, develop, and execute a student-curated exhibit project, including insight into building museum partnerships; articulating and scaffolding student learning objectives that are grounded in musical, historical, and anthropological theory; facilitating the project itself; and organizing community outreach programs, all with reference to the pedagogical frameworks mentioned above. Finally, we share student reflections on how their approaches to music, history, culture, and the value of public culture-work had changed because of their work on this exhibit project.

specific categories of such objects found in multiple cultures (instruments, masks, etc.) follow English-language Western conventions for clarity. Culture-specific objects are given their proper name when discussed individually.

4. Our focus here centers on literature on musical instruments rather than a wider array of performance-related objects for concision. We recommend that exhibit designers engage in further depth with literature across the performing arts as relevant to their specific exhibit topics.

Music: A Material Turn

The history of musical instrument collecting in the West is deeply rooted in the European colonial project, as is broader interest in ethnographic collecting, museum studies, and the many sub-disciplines of Western musicology. Beginning in the late sixteenth century, “cabinets of curiosities” filled with a mixture of interesting natural and human-made objects sourced from locations throughout the world became popular with European aristocrats, merchants, and scientists. Such collections were used to demonstrate the owner’s social prestige, economic standing, and intellectual curiosity, and were used as aesthetic collections as well as for scholarly study.⁵ In subsequent centuries, the European Romantic movement renewed interest in domestic collecting of natural and folk objects, but prestigious collections increasingly featured items gathered from distant parts of the world through sea exploration. Performance objects are found in many such collections. For example, in the late eighteenth century, musical instruments were included among the ethnological material collected as part of Captain James Cook’s expeditions to the Pacific Ocean region, which constituted the first recorded contact with that area of the world by Europeans.⁶ The core holdings of many museums derive from these early collections.

Novel instrument forms and musical practices greatly interested European patrons, but instruments often arrived completely de-contextualized from systematic information about how they were made, used, and valued by those who created them. This meant that even those who collected instruments for purposes of research began first to investigate and classify instruments based on physical properties alone. Early collectors created analytical frameworks that mirrored the typological schemes employed by naturalists, essentially adopting their concern for form.⁷ The Hornbostel-Sachs classification system introduced in 1914, which organizes instruments by sound production and whose structure mirrors the Dewey Decimal library organization system, grew from this lineage of inquiry.⁸ In its own time this system was considered revolutionary;

5. MacGregor Impey and Arthur Oliver, *The Origins of Museums: The Cabinet of Curiosities in Sixteenth- and Seventeenth-Century Europe* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001), 737.

6. Adrienne L. Kaeppler, “Polynesian Music, Captain Cook, and the Romantic Movement in Europe,” *Music Educators Journal* 65, no. 3 (1978): 54–60; Jeremy Coote, ed., “Cook-Voyage Collections of ‘Artificial Curiosities’ in Britain and Ireland, 1771–2015,” *Museum Ethnographers Group Occasional Paper* 5 (2015): 74–122.

7. Christian F. Feest, “‘Repatriation’: A European View on the Question of Restitution of Native American Artifacts,” *European Review of Native American Studies* 9, no. 2 (1995): 33.

8. Erich M. von Hornbostel and Curt Sachs, “Systematik der Musikinstrumente. Ein Versuch,” in *Zeitschrift für Ethnologie* 46, nos. 4–5 (1914): 553–590.

its perceptibly scientific scheme that could be applied to all instruments on a global scale implied, at least to some degree, that “exotic” and “primitive” instruments had commonalities with the “sophisticated” instruments most valued by Western society. The system implied that all instruments were worthy of study, even as its approaches and utility have been criticized in more recent times for both its tone and standardizing, mono-conceptual approach.

In the twenty-first century, the disciplines of ethno/musicology, organology, and museum studies continue to grapple with these colonialist legacies. With an eye to the persistent inequalities of the past and present, the problem of how to productively teach, research, and present information to the public that builds on past knowledge while positively moving beyond colonialist legacies remains a work in progress. The terms “decolonizing” or “decolonial work” have been frequently applied to such efforts, including social justice, sustainability, and preservation work designed to dismantle the legacy of historical colonial systems. Scholars also apply these terms to their efforts to restructure research, education, performance, and their relationships to each other.⁹ Yet, even as such decolonial work is happening in musicological and anthropological research, it often remains invisible to students, especially at an introductory level.¹⁰ Stand-alone world music courses frequently remain isolated within the curriculum.¹¹ Further, the inclusion of diverse subject matter alone is insufficient to present alternatives to historically Eurocentric power relations and norms of cultural and artistic representation.¹²

Because of the colonial histories of collecting and curating musical instruments, the opportunity to curate a public exhibit provides students profound opportunities to engage in decolonial learning. First, providing students an introduction to collecting practices, like that provided in the brief history above, encourages them to examine the historiography of the educational structures in which they are participants—an important first step in understanding how their own knowledge has been and could be constructed. Second, depending

9. Eve Tuck and K. Wayne Yang, “Decolonization is Not a Metaphor,” *Decolonization: Indigeneity, Education & Society* 1, no. 1 (2012): 1–40. The discourse on decolonization efforts is too extensive to discuss in detail here; thus, we engage with several sources that are immediately pertinent to our pedagogical approach.

10. Margaret E. Walker, “Towards a Decolonized Music History Curriculum,” this *Journal* 10, no. 1 (2020): 1–19.

11. E. Eugene Helm, *The Canon and the Curricula: A Study of Musicology and Ethnomusicology Programs in America* (Stuyvesant, New York: Pendragon Press, 1994); Henry Kingsbury, *Music, Talent, and Performance: A Conservatory Cultural System* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1988); Bruno Nettl, *Heartland Excursions: Ethnomusicological Reflections on Schools of Music* (Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1995).

12. Michael A. Figueroa, “Decolonizing ‘Intro to World Music?’” this *Journal* 10, no. 1 (2020): 39–57.

on its situation within a specific course, learning about instruments presents opportunities for instructors to challenge traditional curricular structures that frequently divide Western music history and ethnomusicology. Additionally, students learn critical approaches to museum representation that include problematizing the divisions between ethnographic and art museums. They learn to reframe narratives and display conventions within exhibits. They consider how to center indigenous knowledge and the meaning these objects might have through repatriation or re-connection to their source communities.¹³ Finally, such work also decentralizes educators as the sole experts, allowing students—who are often perceived to be at the fringes of music knowledge production—to develop expertise and representational decision-making skills. It is their diverse past experiences and potential for creative new forms of inquiry that are crucial to developing the next generation of patrons of history, culture, and the arts.¹⁴

Cultivating Wonder with Instruments

It is important that students envision the objects not only as relics or sound-making devices, but as important participants within their own historical, cultural, and artistic narratives. This engagement transforms students' initial wonder into a deeper and more nuanced understanding of the cultural role of musical objects. In "The Social Life of Musical Instruments," Eliot Bates presents a transformational framework for considering how to treat the material products of musical production.¹⁵ Extending Appadurai's arguments about approaching objects from the perspectives of their life-histories, Bates incorporates perspectives from material culture studies, actor-network theory, as well as musicology and ethnomusicology to propose investigations of instruments that treat instruments as *subjects* rather than *objects* of study—essentially, as actors whose

13. Margareta von Oswald and Jonas Tinus, eds., *Across Anthropology: Troubling Colonial Legacies, Museums, and the Curatorial* (Leuven: Leuven University Press, 2020); Elizabeth Mackinlay, "Decolonization and Applied Ethnomusicology: 'Story-ing' the Personal-Political-Possible in Our Work," in Svanibor Pettan and Jeff Todd Titon, eds., *The Oxford Handbook of Applied Ethnomusicology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015), 379–397.

14. Depending on the scope of the project, other decolonial approaches may emerge, including having students perform research using primarily indigenous sources or methodologies for research and working directly with constituent communities. See Linda Tuhiwai Smith, *Decolonizing Methodologies: Research and Indigenous Peoples* (London: Zed Books, 2012).

15. Eliot Bates, "The Social Life of Musical Instruments," *Ethnomusicology* 56, no. 3 (2012): 363–95.

histories and cultural contexts are individually worthy of attention.¹⁶ Placing musical instruments at the center of historical or ethnographic analyses invites students to consider materiality and how music has moved through the world, whether in the past decade or over the past two millennia.¹⁷ In short, investigating the lives of instruments and other performance-related objects can provide insight into not only instrument structure, but also the historical and cultural contexts, practices, and values of those who made, used, and distributed them.¹⁸

Every performance-related object has a story to tell—either a story specific to that object and its individual past, or a more general narrative about its historical and cultural context and place of origin. The film *The Red Violin* (1998), which traces the adventures of a single Stradivarius violin through three continents and four centuries, provides an example (if a fictional and fanciful one) of an individual instrument's life-history and why one might be compelled to tell its story. But compelling narratives do not have to be centered on the exciting life of a singular object. Ugandan drum families, for example, tell stories of kinship and the modern transformation of kingship.¹⁹ Stradivarius violins and Haitian drums speak of intertwined efforts to avert ecological and cultural loss.²⁰ Depending on if they are played by men or women, different instruments—such as the guitar—can challenge or reify extant gender roles.²¹ Finally, the process of making, repairing, or even recreating an Indian tabla or a Balinese gamelan showcases how instruments have distinctive identities that

16. Arjun Appadurai, *The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986); George W. Stocking, ed., *Objects and Others: Essays on Museums and Material Culture 3* (Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 1988); Bruno Latour, "On Actor-Network Theory: A Few Clarifications" *Soziale Welt* 47, no. 4 (1996): 369–81; DeVale, *Issues in Organology*.

17. Kevin Dawe, "Guitar Ethnographies: Performance, Technology and Material Culture," *Ethnomusicology Forum* 22, no. 1 (2013): 1–25; Marko Aho, *The Tangible in Music: The Tactile Learning of a Musical Instrument* (London: Routledge, 2016); Jonathan De Souza, *Music at Hand: Instruments, Bodies, and Cognition* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2017).

18. Viewing musical instruments as valued subjects also encourages students to hold them in higher regard and treat instruments respectfully when they are handled in a curatorial setting.

19. Damascus Kafumbe, *Tuning the Kingdom: Kawuugulu Musical Performance, Politics, and Storytelling in Buganda* (Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2018).

20. Aaron S. Allen, "Fatto di Fiemme': Stradivari's Violins and the Musical Trees of the Paneveggio," in Laura Auricchio, Elizabeth Heckendorn Cook, and Giulia Pacini, eds., *Invaluable Trees: Cultures of Nature, 1660-1830* (Oxford: Voltaire Foundation, 2012), 301–315; Rebecca Dirksen, "Haiti's Drums and Trees: Facing Loss of the Sacred," *Ethnomusicology* 63, no. 1 (2019): 43–77.

21. Veronica Doubleday, "Sounds of Power: An Overview of Musical Instruments and Gender," *Ethnomusicology Forum* 17, no. 1 (2008): 3–39.

are shaped by the individuals and communities that use them.²² In sum, there is no shortage of compelling ways for students to understand the intersection of history, cultural practice, and artistic practice as they examine musical objects.

Any instrument, whether perceived as “exotic” or “mundane,” can be a compelling subject of study. Using familiar instruments that students may already own is an easy way to facilitate classroom encounters with musical objects; the instruments are readily available and student-musicians can take an active role in leading personalized, informed discussions about the instruments. For example, the substantive research literature on guitars can bring students to understand the construction, history, and global distribution of the instrument, as well as its multi-genre development, usage, and social significance. It is an instrument that is commonplace in North America and essential to a multitude of global musical genres over the past five centuries. Large instrumental sets owned by universities that are already used for hands-on music education also provide compelling subjects for student examination. Engagements with these instruments are particularly fruitful when they come from musical traditions that are largely unfamiliar to students. In a globalized teaching context, this could include Western orchestral or band instruments. The novelty of encountering new forms, materials, and iconographic features is a good lead-in to observation, research, and ultimately creating knowledge through informed interpretation.

Museums with large collections of instruments and performance paraphernalia are potential sources for musical objects that can become the subject of student encounters.²³ Such collections include art and natural history museums (e.g., the Metropolitan Museum), music museums with substantive instrumental collections (e.g., the Rock and Roll Hall of Fame), museums of individual artists’ personal collections (e.g., Elvis Presley’s Graceland and Prince’s Paisley Park) and museums devoted specifically to instrumental collections (e.g., the Musical Instrument Museum in Phoenix). Smaller collections can be found in colleges and universities, museums dedicated to a variety of subjects, historic houses, or can even be assembled from the personal collections of faculty, staff, or students. Any of these settings provide opportunities not only for students to engage with instruments, but also potentially research, construct, and present their own interpretations of the life-worlds of instruments. Contrary to Bates’s

22. Allen P. Roda, “Tabla Tuning on the Workshop Stage: Toward a Materialist Musical Ethnography,” *Ethnomusicology Forum* 23, no. 3 (2014): 360–82; Tyler Yamin, “One or Several Gamelan? Perpetual (Re)construction in the Life of a Balinese Gamelan Semara Pagulingan,” *Ethnomusicology* 63, no. 3 (2019): 357–392.

23. Leonie Hannan, Rosalind Duhs, and Helen Chatterjee, “Object-Based Learning: A Powerful Pedagogy for Higher Education,” in *Museums and Higher Education Working Together* (New York: Routledge, 2016), 159–168.

assertion that “Instrument museums are mausoleums, places for the display of the musically dead, with organologists acting as morticians, preparing dead instrument bodies for preservation and display,”²⁴ student work on the creation and display of musical artifacts allows for the evocation of past musical and historical-social lives and the assumption of new life by an object previously viewed as inanimate.

Creating “Musical Narratives of the Southwest Pacific Rim”

Before we discuss generalizable strategies in the next section, we describe our own collaboration in creating the exhibit “Musical Narratives of the Southwest Pacific Rim” to illustrate the process of creating a student-curated exhibit and highlight potential outcomes. Though no two educators will have the same available resources, our journey demonstrates many core principles of engaging students that can be adapted for diverse resource sets and pedagogical situations. The “Musical Narratives” exhibit grew out of the Department of Music’s and the Museum of Anthropology’s convergent, pre-existing emphases on community-engaged pedagogy. The Wake Forest University Museum of Anthropology (MOA) is a teaching museum with a permanent collection of more than 30,000 objects. Led by an academic director, MOA is similar to many museums and galleries on college campuses that frame museums as interactive spaces that bridge classroom knowledge and experiential learning through student-centered exhibit curation.²⁵ This model allows students in-course opportunities to develop areas of expertise integral to professional museum work.

Our collaboration spanned three semesters and included students from three iterations of a semester-long introductory world music course. While some students in this course were music or anthropology majors or minors, the majority of students were enrolled in the course to fulfill a general education requirement. In the first semester, students could choose any relevant items from the collection, with choices ranging geographically from Mexico to Mali to Papua New Guinea. Students worked individually; the primary intent of the project was to provide an opportunity for each student to gain extra depth of study in their area of choice. In the second semester, we narrowed the range of objects down to a series of countries around the Pacific Rim—Indonesia, Papua New Guinea, New Zealand, Samoa, and Australia—and developed the parameters for turning the students’ work into an exhibit. In the third and final

24. Bates, “The Social Life of Musical Instruments,” 365.

25. Christina Kreps, “University Museums as Laboratories for Experiential Learning and Engaged Practice,” *Museum Anthropology* 38, no. 2 (2015): 96–111.

iteration of the project, students in the class received some information from the previous group's work to assist in their preliminary examinations of the objects and worked directly on designing the exhibit.²⁶ Though each semester's focus was crucial in developing our process as collaborators, this timeline could be compressed into a single semester. In terms of our pedagogy, the important element is that students participate in every step of exhibit development.

The pedagogical framework for studying musical objects at the museum began in the introductory unit of the course, where students received a brief global overview of instrument classification. Discussion of culturally specific systems—such as the Western orchestral system, the Chinese *bayin* (八音) system, and the classification for Indian instruments presented in the *Nāṭya Śāstra* (नाट्य शास्त्र), all of which reappeared at appropriate points later in the course—was complemented by more in-depth organological work. In this introductory unit, students examined a variety of musical instruments that were sourced from their instructor and their classmates within the classroom setting, where they considered materials, method of construction, and sound production and were encouraged to ask questions about musical and social performance contexts. Attending live performances and participating in hands-on music playing opportunities in other portions of the course reinforced students' observational skills, while discussions of specific instruments within units devoted to theoretical subjects (like gender) or historical-cultural subjects (like the historic and contemporary roles of drum families within African royal court ensembles) highlighted instruments' changing roles within different times, places, and contexts. In sum, students were instructed to consider instruments simultaneously as musical, material, and social objects, and to build on information across topical units to develop a more nuanced understanding of the multiple lives of musical instruments.

In more direct preparation for the museum project, students were encouraged to reflect on the historical and cultural representational strategies that they had encountered in museums that they had visited in the past. Students' previous experiences with attending museums was varied, but we found that most students had at least encountered small displays of objects during prior school field trips, which was sufficient to form a basis for reflection. To provide a point of focus for their thoughts, the students were also assigned to read and react to an academic article and several popular articles about the Musée du Quai Branly in Paris, an internationally recognized ethnographic museum with a significant Australian and island Pacific collection (including objects from

26. Though in this case working across three semesters proved helpful to creating the project design and procedures, we believe that future collaborations could be accomplished under a shorter timeline.

the Cook Expeditions) that has in recent years experimented with variations on traditional museum display models.²⁷ Originally printed in newspapers and popular periodicals, these critical review articles of the museum provided a concrete and accessible introduction to the aesthetics, practicalities, and ethics of museum display, and a point of stimulus for students to organize thoughts about their own past experiences and hopes for their curation work.²⁸

The instructors chose the premise and organizational schema of the exhibit and translated the exhibit development process into a course assignment. Within this framework, the project embodied democratic pedagogical approaches by including practices that support student choice, agency, and decision-making. Students were able to choose their own subjects of study, decide which musical objects to research, structure their research teams, evaluate the needs of communities that would see the exhibit, and make substantive choices about how their research would be communicated to a public audience.²⁹



Figure 1: Students receive instructions to examine museum objects.
Photo credit: Elizabeth Clendinning.

27. James Clifford, "Quai Branly in Process," *October* 120 (2007): 3–23; Michael Kimmelman, "A Heart Of Darkness in the City Of Light," *The New York Times*, July 2, 2006, <https://www.nytimes.com/2006/07/02/arts/design/a-heart-of-darkness-in-the-city-of-light.html>.

28. Kreps, "University Museums as Laboratories."

29. Dana Bennis, "What is Democratic Education?" Institute for Democratic Education in America, (accessed January 12, 2021), <http://democraticeducation.org/index.php/features/what-is-democratic-education/>.

After students had chosen their working groups, they visited the museum and examined relevant musical objects. The museum staff prepared for the students' visits by pre-identifying a core set of relevant objects and preparing information about their provenance. Understanding how museum objects were collected can be as important to research and interpretation as the object's form and associated function. The students received an introduction to the museum itself and its collections and how to use the online museum catalogue. Donning blue latex gloves, they passed around instruments, examining each to decide what piqued their interest and learning safe object-handling skills in the process. They toured the room in the museum where their class exhibit would be installed and shown the types of display cases, lighting, and other resources that they might expect to house their objects. Finally, they received practical instructions to complete the project, including several blocks of time set aside for their work with their chosen objects under guidance of museum staff.

Following this visit, students filled out worksheets to help them organize their observations on the musical objects (see appendices). They then worked independently, in consultation with their instructor and museum staff, to conduct research on the objects and their culture of origin. Student groups produced eight written works during the semester based on their collections research: one 200 to 250-word text panel that introduced the objects' countries of origin, and seven different 25 to 50-word object labels that identified a specific object, its physical properties, and its typical historical and cultural context. Student groups also identified opportunities for special interactive features, such as video or hands-on activities that would make a visit to the display more educational and engaging.

At the end of the semester, students submitted a final project containing their text and labels, a diagram of their ideal display layout, audiovisual materials that might enhance the display, and personal reflections on their work and the working process. Some students participated in an extra credit opportunity to help the MOA staff install the exhibit according to class designs. One month after the next semester began, the exhibit was ready to open.

Building an Exhibit: Strategies for Success

Locating instrument collections

A collections-based instrument research project requires a source of instruments. Dedicated instrument collections are rare and tend to be focused on Western musical practices. Outside of specialized museums, most dedicated collections are associated with universities or music schools, and so their curators are likely used to working with faculty and students. If you are fortunate



Figure 2: The authors with the Indonesia portion of the student-curated exhibit. Photo credit: John Stifler.

to teach at or near an institution with a robust collection, then hopefully our experiences will encourage you to consider the benefits of student curators. You can locate collections by reaching out to museum staff through communication networks maintained by professional organizations, such as the Association of Academic Museums and Galleries.

Private instrument collectors are another potential source. Collectors are often performers themselves, but they may be difficult to identify unless they are publicly known for their collecting. Unless you already know such a collector, institutional collections are the most approachable. Even if you are not near such private or institutional collections, you may still be able to access musical objects by negotiating a loan, though shipping can be expensive and many collectors may balk at sending their valuable objects to unfamiliar partners. Many institutional collections have missions that include outreach, education, and research, and may be amenable to facilitating your project. Even if your local collecting institution does not have an instrument collection, it is worthwhile to partner with them, as other institutions are typically more willing to loan to institutions than individuals.

Locating instruments in other museums and collections

Fortunately, instruments are often included in larger collections owned by museums of all kinds. Historical collections often include instruments. These may be objects associated with specific musicians or historical individuals, but they may also be associated with certain time periods and social classes. In the United States, many county historical societies maintain collections from their locales, and may be a source of instruments that represent regional musical traditions. However, such collections do not always reflect local cultures. Many historical collections include objects acquired by travelers, missionaries, and merchants. These are often acquired as souvenirs, rather than performance objects. It could be helpful to clarify with the collections staff that you don't necessarily need the instruments to be playable! The cultural and historical value of the instruments are equally important in motivating student research.

If students will be working with a limited range of musical traditions, heritage institutions or community museums may have appropriate instrument collections. Many cultural entrepreneurs identify musical instruments and related paraphernalia as excellent symbols of heritage, and so instruments are often available and oriented toward display. Negotiating access is a major concern if the instruments are still in use, as it may be difficult or impossible to remove them from cases until after the exhibit has closed.

Other types of collections may include instruments related to a diverse range of musical traditions. Ethnographic collections typically contain musical instruments and have the benefit of focusing on non-Western traditions. Like dedicated instrument collections, these are relatively rare. Many large fine arts museums include musical instruments in their collections, such as the Metropolitan Museum of Art and the Museum of Fine Arts Boston. Smaller art museums may have musical instrument collections, but this is often not the case. Occasionally science or children's museums will have instrument collections. However, these types of collections are generally not rich sources for collaboration.

Working with stakeholders

Collectors and collections staff will be important stakeholders throughout the entire research project, but they will be most involved in the initial stages of the project. Students will need access to objects for the observation and research stages. Access may be limited by the collector's schedule or by the space allocated to a collections staff. This process can be streamlined by pre-selecting appropriate objects for student research. However, student choice can be a powerful motivator, so a good compromise is to pre-select a pool of potential objects, and then let students choose from the pool.

Whatever the source, collections staff will be concerned about two things: the safety of the objects, and the value of the objects to the project. You will likely be asked how the objects will be cared for, what kind of display environment they will be in, and what security measures will be put in place to safeguard them from damage or theft. Expect to be asked why these objects are essential to the project, how they will be interpreted, and how the collecting institution will benefit or be credited. Having clear answers to these questions before you approach collections staff will show your good intentions to working with them as a valued stakeholder in your project.

The collector or collections staff you are working with are one stakeholder in this project, in addition to you and your students. However, it is worthwhile to identify other stakeholders early in the design process. Potential stakeholders include local institutions that are facilitating a loan, the gallery that is providing space for your exhibition, other instructors that may use the exhibit as a teaching resource, and community organizations that will visit the exhibit. By reaching out early, you can better utilize opportunities and resources these stakeholders present to you, as well as better anticipate any requirements they may have.

Designing a project

Once a collection has been identified, you can begin to design the research project. Begin your design process by thinking about the outcome. We began our project, for example, by thinking about the public exhibition of student research. However, other outcomes could be a musical performance, a digital humanities product such as a website or mobile app, or an educational outreach program. Whatever the outcome, it must connect with both the collections available to you and to the student learning outcomes in your curriculum.

The project's theme is the overarching idea that connects all the objects on display with the students' research and interpretation. It can relate to any facet of the project, but the best themes are those in which students invest themselves. Good themes complement the learning outcomes you have for your students as well as impress those same outcomes on visitors. Usually, the theme of an exhibit is represented in its physical organization. For our project, the theme was cultural diversity in the western Pacific region, and so the exhibited objects were organized according to geography and cultural identity. In a different exhibit with a different theme, the same objects might have been organized according to their performance context (courtly, popular, religious) or according to their construction materials (plant fibers, wood, animal hide, etc.). Of course, you should also choose a theme that is supported by the collection you have available. Avoid the impulse to force the objects to fit a pre-determined theme, as this will result in poor research and interpretation in the end.

Most projects will follow a standard trajectory of initial observation, research, interpretation, writing, re-writing, fabrication, installation, and programming. Each stage requires different kinds of work, and each offers students a valuable learning experience. For each stage, consider how students will conduct their work. Will they work individually or collaborate in groups? Will their work be checked by the instructor, by other students, or by stakeholders? What is the standard for work to be presented in a public exhibit? What are the consequences if work does not meet that standard? Addressing these questions early will set clear expectations for your students.

Facilitating student research

The first encounter your students have with the objects is a powerful experience. While there do not need to be set outcomes for their initial observations, giving the students a framework to make sense of their experience can be helpful. Greenblatt's concepts of resonance and wonder are useful terms for students to articulate their encounters.³⁰ Another useful exercise is to have students write descriptive summaries of the objects, including their physical dimensions, materials, aesthetic properties, and points of articulation. With these descriptions, students can speculate on the object's historical and cultural context, such as the way it might be used, where it was created, and who would be familiar with it.

A goal of student research should be to compose an object life history. For this, they will need access to the provenance documents associated with the collection. These documents give evidence for how an object was collected, who owned it, and perhaps what testing or dating has been applied. While provenance is often used to establish ownership and value, for research it is helpful to show how the object's life history has intersected with broader historical and cultural trends. This is particularly helpful for objects associated with famous musicians, composers, or instrument makers.

Unfortunately, most common instruments and musical objects do not have detailed provenance documentation. In the absence of specific details, you can suggest students compare their objects to similar objects with known provenance. For this, they can consult museum and gallery publications, databases of other collections (such as those available online from the Metropolitan Museum of Art or the Smithsonian Institution), or auction catalogs. Additional secondary sources can help give context to the objects' life histories that students have established.

30. Greenblatt, *Marvelous Possessions*, 19ff.

Interpretive writing for exhibits

An important part of exhibit interpretation is to have students write original text based on their own research and experience. Museum writing is an excellent opportunity to integrate rhetorical writing skills into the project.³¹ Writing for an exhibit gives students a new way of articulating their experiences with musical instruments through the genre of museum interpretation. Museum interpretation is an example of an authentic writing genre that provides students with a real audience and real motivation for crafting effective and polished texts.³² The research they conduct becomes the source that they share with visitors, effectively turning them into experts. The differences between this public-oriented genre and more traditional academic writing empowers students by elevating their research experiences.

Equipped with life histories, students are now ready to distill their research into interpretive text for the exhibit. The goal of interpretive text is to communicate information about the objects on display that enriches the visitor's experience. This information can foster curiosity and get visitors to ask questions about the object, or it might guide the visitor to look closely at certain details, or it could give context to the object that is not obvious through visual inspection. Labels often start by directing the visitor to what they are already looking at or experiencing, and then segueing to novel revelations. Students will need to carefully select what information they present, as the limitations of interpretive text mean they can likely only express one or two ideas.

It is important that students understand their audience in framing their interpretive texts. Will it be other students? Members of the public? School children on field trips? Each group will find different kinds of information interesting, as well as come in with difference prior knowledge and experience. Regardless of audience, there are certain stylistic conventions common to interpretive museum writing as a genre. Use clear language that avoids more poetic devices, such as metaphor or alliteration. These techniques are not commonly used because museum texts are designed to communicate clearly to visitors of all backgrounds and educational levels. Similarly, avoid specialized terminology and infrequently used words or phrases. Visitors expect short pieces of text: typically, 25–50 words for a single object's label, 100–200 words for a text panel introducing a thematic section of the exhibit, and 250–500 words for a long introduction or summary of the exhibit. These text lengths are much

31. John C. Bean, *Engaging Ideas: The Professor's Guide to Integrating Writing, Critical Thinking, and Active Learning in the Classroom* (Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons, 2011), 39–51.

32. Dee L. Fink, *Creating Significant Learning Experiences: An Integrated Approach to Designing College Courses* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2013).

shorter than what students are used to writing. Encourage them to be concise and choose their words carefully.

Editing and revising must be part of the exhibit project and is a process that should be undertaken dialectically between students, instructors, and other stakeholders, such as museum staff. It can be very helpful to set student expectations regarding the editing process and what editorial decisions the museum might make to fit their standards of public display. Emphasize to the students that making revisions is a normal part of producing an exhibit. At the same time, have a clear policy as to how you would accommodate a student wanting to make powerful or provocative public statements with their interpretive text. For the “Musical Narratives” project, students in each group reviewed their own texts. The course instructor then reviewed the labels for accuracy and MOA staff reviewed the texts for clarity.

Public considerations

It often makes sense to partner with an established gallery space as they can provide access to display equipment, such as cases, vitrines, pedestals, staging blocks, and label holders. They are also set up to manage visitors and provide security to the objects on display. That said, nearly any publicly accessible space can be used as a gallery for your exhibit if the security of the objects can be assured.

Visitors make sense of the objects on display visually by viewing the objects, cognitively by reading associated labels, and spatially by navigating the gallery. Often it is the spatial relationship that is neglected. Encourage your students to develop a layout for the exhibit that emphasizes connections between objects by positioning them in relation to each other. Have your students try to anticipate how a visitor will move through the gallery. Is there any information they absolutely need to see first to make sense of the rest? Does the exhibit have to be viewed in a specific order, or can visitors freely bounce between different display cases? Are there any specific cultural mandates for object display, such as a prohibition on certain ritual objects being stored near the ground, which should be honored if possible?

After the students finish their assignments and the exhibit opens, it may seem like the project is done. However, the exhibit isn't complete until its final closing date. Museum exhibits are great venues for other types of outreach and programming. Students can invite community groups to visit the exhibit, serve as docents for tours, or organize special events such as guest lectures or performances within the space. Encourage the students to think creatively about the lasting impact of the exhibit and how this associated programming can be meaningful to local audiences.

Pedagogical Connections and Measuring Impact

Though this work can be undertaken at any level of collegiate or graduate study, such projects particularly benefit introductory-level students because they provide a tangible link in their initial encounters to the artistic production of other times and places. Because instruments and other performance-related objects are used in different ways throughout global history and in a variety of artistic contexts, student research work with musical objects provides opportunities for them to learn about performance cultures in a way that cross-cuts traditional historically or geographically oriented course design in musicology. Museum curation projects provide opportunities for students to engage in democratic learning, build substantive cognitive skills (including the full range of those outlined in Bloom's Taxonomy), and improve cultural competency. By having students take an active role in developing a public exhibition of musical objects, such projects viscerally engage students in understanding the colonialist collecting impulses at the historic roots of both ethno/musicology and museum studies, as well as provide ways for them to gain practical experience in finding more equitable ways to represent and advocate for musical and cultural communities.

Measuring the impact of any pedagogical project or public display is a complex task. One way to approach this task is to examine how well students were able to achieve specific learning outcomes. In our project, we primarily targeted cognitive and social outcomes with our students, though the project also involved physical and emotional learning. We also encouraged students to set their own goals for themselves in working on the project and evaluate their own learning. Finally, our project was specifically designed to increase cultural competence as students research musical objects and present their findings. This mix of models for constructing learning objectives offers opportunities to incorporate a range of metrics to examine what and how students are learning, including but not limited to traditional Western models.

One way to identify and classify many of the cognitive outcomes from this project is to map them onto Bloom's Taxonomy.³³ We view their categories not as hierarchical (such that students must master one level before moving to the next), but as mutually reinforcing and appropriate objectives for students of all levels. Exhibit curation projects engage all aspects of the cognitive model: remembering (learning basic information about performance objects), understanding (organizing this information), applying (using this information

33. Our discussion here most closely follows the 2001 revision: Lorin W. Anderson and David R. Krathwohl, ed., *A Taxonomy for Learning, Teaching, and Assessing: A Revision of Bloom's Taxonomy of Educational Objectives* (State College, PA: Longman, 2001).

to group or draw connections between objects), analyzing (planning how to display objects together), evaluating (assessing the plan's efficacy and appropriateness to subject matter and audience), and creating (designing the final project). At each step in their work on the project, students cycled between these different stages as they learned new information and worked discursively with each other, their instructor, and museum staff. The other two models of Bloom's Taxonomy, the affective domain (emotion-based) and the psychomotor domain (action-based) are also useful to understand secondary outcomes of the project, such as the students' newfound respect for and protectiveness of the objects in their display and the acquisition of professional-standard object handling techniques, respectively.

Having students accomplish assignment objectives related to building community and increasing cultural competency were also crucial outcomes of this project. As discussed previously, the project was rooted in democratic learning processes in which instructors guided students to form and self-regulate their research teams, conduct research, and evaluate what they had learned to design exhibits that would both satisfy class requirements and meet community needs. In doing so, many students learned specific research skills that they had not practiced previously, including working with physical objects, consulting with museum staff, using the campus library, assessing the appropriateness (and copyright status) of audiovisual materials, and seeking further information from subject-area experts outside of the campus community. These processes inherently overlapped with objectives related to increased cultural competence in that students not only increased their breadth and depth of knowledge about other cultures but came to understand multiple points of view and worked to respectfully articulate the practices and viewpoints of others.³⁴ In doing so, they also learned to evaluate, critique, and in a small way re-envision current power structures regarding ethnographic display and public representation of artistic cultures.

In our experience, the quality of student work either met or exceeded expectations in achieving the level of understanding that would traditionally be measured by other assignments such as tests or exams, performance reviews, research papers, and individual reflections. In some cases, student work far exceeded the general expectation for the level of research work in an

34. Janet M. Bennett, "Transformative Training: Designing Programs for Culture Learning," in M.A. Moodian, ed., *Contemporary Leadership and Intercultural Competence: Understanding and Utilizing Cultural Diversity to Build Successful Organizations* (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 2008), 95–110. Though this exhibit topic did not offer opportunities to connect directly with local heritage communities, this is an important further step when such communities exist. See Kreps, "University Museums as Laboratories."

introductory-level course; for example, some students used interlibrary loan to access materials and emailed scholars around the world in pursuit of information about their objects. Importantly, this collaboration opened new opportunities for interdisciplinary, cross-campus, and cross-generational learning, as well as more interest and support for faculty and students in both music and museum studies.

Perhaps most importantly, many students who participated in the project identified aspects of their work as experiences that would stay with them after the class ended. Most student reflections mentioned working within and managing groups as an important part of their learning. Some also commented on how the project improved their use of campus research resources. For example, one student explained,

Coming in as a freshman, I was in the dark about a lot of the facilities and available resources at the university. This project pushed me outside of my comfort zone to seek out those resources and I am so glad I did. I learned how to effectively use the databases as well as how to check books out of the library, both through course reserves and by searching through the shelves. I am much more acquainted with the library and more comfortable going into research projects in the future.

In addition to foundational research and group-work skills, students also took pride in their own development of higher-level skills related to the course material. Many students commented on understanding, respecting, and developing expertise through their work. As one student wrote, “At the beginning of this project, I was personally terrified by the thought of creating and presenting a museum exhibit to the public; I had absolutely no background knowledge of the subject that I would be curating.” However, by the end of the project, this student expressed confidence in her work and identified knowledge and skills that would be transferrable to her major. Students also enjoyed developing interactive materials for the museum’s iPads that allowed visitors to play instruments from the museum’s education collection. Students claimed that the interactive experiences would “be much more memorable as they [museum audiences] can have a chance to delve more into the culture and how it has traditional, yet also modern, music.” Finally, students focused on the challenges of cultural representation. As one student wrote, “Through this project, I learned that a lot of work goes in to planning museum exhibits. I also learned that representing a culture in only a few words is very difficult. Humans are very complex and the societies that they create are tough to generalize.”

Teaching musicology with museum collections empowers students to learn about and experience instruments in meaningful ways. The project gave the student curators an opportunity to see how their research and writing—even in academic subjects new to most students in the course—could be applied in a very immediate way. Students learned to share their insights critically and appropriately through object-oriented and genre-specific media, authentic genres of presentation with the potential for a far broader impact than other traditional forms of classroom assignments. Crucially, creating a successful museum exhibit requires close attention to the importance of stakeholders, including the museum staff, visitors, descendants of the object's source communities, and the students themselves. Approaching musical objects from this perspective goes beyond the formal concerns of organology by emphasizing human connections to such objects, aligning our pedagogical strategy with decolonizing modes of knowledge production that seek to transform the power dynamics embedded in our class assignments. We hope that the discussion of our example and general principles encourages others to use the curation and exhibition of musical objects in their teaching practices as a way to help students build tangible connections to artistic practices of the past as well as cultivate appreciation of musical objects within their own contemporary communities.

Appendix A: Questions for Students Examining a Musical Object

Answer questions #1–3 during the initial object observation period.

1. Basic object information:
 - a. What is the object's general name (i.e. drum, mask, etc.)?
 - b. What is the object's specific name?
 - c. Where is the object from or where was it used?
2. Description of object:
 - a. What materials were used to make the object?
 - b. How is it constructed?
 - c. Is there wear or damage to the instrument? How do you think the object became worn like this?
 - d. Are there designs or ornamentations? Is there a maker's mark?
 - e. Are there any other notable visual or sonic features of the object that *might* be symbolic within the culture in which it was used?
3. Usage of Object:
 - a. *If it is an instrument:*
 - i. How does it create sound?
 - ii. How do you think it was held and played?
 - iii. How could the instrument be classified? (optional)
 - b. *If it is part of a dance costume:*
 - i. Where was it worn on the body?
 - ii. What effects would it have on the movement of a dancer (for example, eyes obscured by narrow mask slits, shaking of bells on bracelets, shoulder pads enlarging body, etc.)?
 - c. *Other performance objects:*
 - i. What function does this object have within a performance context (audio, visual, symbolic, etc.)?

Answer questions #4–5 as you continue to research your object.

4. Questions for further research:
 - a. Which group or individual made, owned, and used this object?
 - b. How does this object relate to individual or group identity?
 - c. How did the object come to arrive at this location?
 - d. What other questions about this object and its usage do you have from your observations?
 - e. What resources might help you answer these questions?
5. Display:
 - a. If this object were to be displayed in the museum, what type of display would best help visitors observe the most interesting

features you noticed above?

- b. What accompanying objects or materials would help tell this object's story?
- c. Are there any limitations that you notice that might alter your recommendations for display? (i.e., object is very fragile, object is light-sensitive, object has culturally based display restrictions)

Appendix B: Questions for Students Designing a Musical Museum Exhibit

1. General exhibit information
 - a. What is the title of your display?
 - b. To what demographics are you targeting your exhibit (children, college students, public)?
2. Exhibit contents
 - a. Which performance-based objects are you planning to display?
 - b. What other materials (maps, written primary source documents, photos, related objects, audiovisual examples) will enhance your exhibit?
3. Narrative and educational themes
 - a. What musical and/or social themes do you want to highlight in your exhibit?
 - b. Why, based on your research, do you think these themes are important and appropriate?
 - c. How will you use your objects and supplementary materials to address these themes?
 - d. Will there be any interactive elements to your exhibit?
 - e. How will your exhibit engage your target audience?
4. Logistical concerns
 - a. Please draw your ideal exhibit layout. Include in the diagram what kind of display cases you would prefer and where each element of the display will be located, including exhibit narrative, objects, object labels, and other materials. Include dimensions of the objects in the display.
 - b. Do you have permissions to display any media you may want to use in your exhibit?
 - c. What questions or concerns do you have about the project at this point? What will help you complete it?

Roundtable: Pandemic Lessons

When our collective pedagogical world was turned upside-down in March of 2020, many of us scrambled to adapt our in-person courses to online and hybrid environments. One solace during this extremely stressful time was that we were not alone. I was heartened to see music history instructors sharing instructional materials, pre-recorded lectures, and assessments. Many appeared as guest speakers in friends' and colleagues' classes via Zoom. And for those who had to take time off due to family care, illness, or bereavement, multiple others offered to step in and help.

Since then, we've discovered that some of the innovations that we implemented during a time of extreme stress were so valuable that we plan to continue to use them, even as we return to our face-to-face classrooms. This roundtable discusses such instances, focusing particularly on new approaches to course organization and content delivery, class discussion and student participation, assessment, a pedagogy of care, and tech tools. The contributors to this roundtable are innovative faculty from a variety of institutions and at the heart of this discussion is care for the student and an excellent, transformative student experience in the music history classroom.

—SARA HAEFELI, EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Course Organization and Content Delivery

Even in my face-to-face classes, I typically rely on a learning management system for organization and assignments (we use Canvas). I break the course into content-based modules, each comprising one or two weeks. Each module consists of a “page” (a Canvas-specific method of organization) providing a brief introduction to the material and the primary learning objectives, my own lecture video (usually ten to twenty minutes in length), additional learning materials for the week, and a list of assignments. In shifting fully online, this method of structuring each course became even more important. One of the key

alterations I made at the start of the Fall 2020 semester was to expand my usual learning materials (previously, reading from the textbook and an in-person lecture) to include a variety of supplemental readings, videos, and podcasts. These provide a variety of methods for students to access the material, but also introduce more provocative issues such as racism, sexism, and classism within the standard Western canon.

To hold students accountable for these learning materials (but not unsustainably increase my grading workload), I “gated” the content on Canvas. When students first log into the course at the beginning of the semester, they see only a “Welcome” module, consisting of my video introduction to the course, the syllabus, and a discussion board with short, personal introductions. Once they view/complete these items, the subsequent modules become available. However, the content page at the start of each module is followed by a five-question, multiple-choice quiz related to the learning materials for the week. Students may take this quiz as many times as necessary, but must complete it with 100% accuracy before subsequent assignments for the week become available. The grading process is fully automated via the learning management system.

—ERIN BAUER, UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN-WHITEWATER

Copyright and the Sharing of Course Materials

The pandemic has heightened our awareness of inequitable access to educational resources. For example, the price of textbooks alone rose 88% between 2006 and 2016,¹ which has in turn prompted public interest groups to take action.² While tuition rates and student loan debt has been a continuous problem, students face even more financial challenges because of the COVID-19 pandemic. Professors now have to balance a number of competing interests as they endeavor to provide students with the most valuable and accessible educational resources. Among these concerns is an effort to protect themselves and their universities from litigation.

1. Gaby Del Valle, “The High Cost of College Textbooks, Explained,” *Vox*, March 6, 2019, <https://www.vox.com/the-goods/2019/3/6/18252322/college-textbooks-cost-expensive-pearson-cengage-mcgraw-hill>.

2. For cost statistics and past legislative measures, see Student PIRGs, “Make Textbooks Affordable,” accessed November 25, 2020, <https://studentpirgs.org/campaigns/make-textbooks-affordable/>.

At the same time, instructors have increasingly experienced the value of sharing resources online, including scores, adaptive quizzes, outlines, and streaming playlists. How does the music history professor keep costs down for students and provide a comprehensive learning experience, all while modeling ethical practices with regard to copyright? Both fair use and the TEACH (Technology, Education, and Copyright Harmonization) Act of 2002 have been our legal guides pertaining to classroom materials. While the understanding of these statutes has always varied in practice, their interpretation during the pandemic has become even more nebulous.

The fair use doctrine states that “use of a copyrighted work, including such use by reproduction in copies...for purposes such as...teaching (including multiple copies for classroom use), scholarship, or research, is not an infringement of copyright.”³ The work distributed must then meet a four-factor test with regard to the purpose and character of its use, the nature of the work, the amount and substantiality of the portion of the work, and the effect its use has upon its potential market value. The National Association for Music Education (NAfME) offers guidance on how the TEACH Act pertains to online learning, and The New Media Rights group offers an online tool to determine if a work intended for use in an online classroom meets the Fair Use or TEACH Act threshold.⁴ Independent reports by various librarians and intellectual property attorneys offer additional guidance, but almost always with the caveat that their words are “educational” and “not legal advice.”⁵ These guidelines are vague and often a professor’s demonstration of due diligence is enough to meet these requirements.

While Fair Use and The TEACH Act provide exceptions and workarounds to sharing copyrighted materials online, instructors nevertheless should always exercise care, as using such materials without permission still poses a risk. With this in mind, I make the following suggestions:

1. Follow one’s own institution’s guidelines and policies.
2. Consult with your librarian. University libraries often have accessible online guides with regard to what is permissible for

3. “Subject Matter and Scope of Copyright,” accessed November 24, 2020, <https://www.copyright.gov/title17/92chap1.html#106>.

4. NAfME and NFHS, “Copyright Guidance for Distance Learning,” (September 2020), <https://nafme.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/09/TEACH-Act-Summary-and-FAQ-September-2020.pdf> and New Media Rights, “Exemptions for Instructors in U.S. Copyright Law,” accessed November 24, 2020, <https://librarycopyright.net/resources/exemptions/index.php>.

5. NAfME and NFHS. Also see Kyle Courtney’s helpful website, “COVID-19, Copyright, & Library Superpowers (Part I), March 11, 2020, <https://kylecourtney.com/2020/03/11/covid-19-copyright-library-superpowers-part-i>.

streaming or sharing. Some libraries, for example, will offer digitized copies of texts when no electronic copy from the publisher is available. Librarians are largely familiar with institutional licensing and may assist in determining which and how much material can be distributed.

3. Use subscription music streaming and score databases available through your institutional library as well as free resources offered by other organizations. Naxos Music Library, Classical Scores Library, Opera in Video, are excellent examples of library subscription services. Eastman's Sibley Library and UCLA's Music Library have substantial open access online score repositories. The Choral Public Domain Library (CPDL) and the International Music Scores Library Project (IMSLP) contain a trove of public domain downloadable scores. Take under advisement that illegally uploaded scores are taken down periodically.
4. Integrate digital manuscripts and archival materials. WorldCat serves as a guide to library archival collections. Some of this material is digitized and freely downloadable, and thus has already been vetted by that library for copyright. The Internet Archive and HathiTrust serve as additional, often full-text, resources.
5. Remind the students to do their own due diligence copyright check. Explain to them the importance of copyright protection for artists, even if it comes at a cost and inconvenience.
6. Link out to resources instead of embedding content. Animated scores on YouTube and Spotify playlists are convenient, but audio recordings are rarely in the public domain.
7. Do not only model due diligence, but teach it. This is a chance for students to learn how to obtain public domain materials through the library or internet. One may find it helpful to create a specific assignment to help students find a score or recording and then determine its copyright status.
8. Ask oneself if certain material is really needed to make a pedagogical point. This is also an opportunity for professors to discover new music and broaden the pedagogical canon. Encourage students to email composers, who are often happy to share their scores, to request scores for personal study. This chance to interact directly with living composers allows one to model professionalism and teach students how to network.

—ALEXANDRA MONCHICK, CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY,
NORTHRIDGE

Class Discussion and Student Participation

When we went on-line in March 2020, I was teaching three general education courses with 60-80 students in each. I cancelled all tests. Instead of continuing to “hold” class on Zoom, I wrote out modules with embedded music videos or short documentaries to view, with a few very simple quizzes that could be taken multiple times. The modules were designed so students could recognize the important points without worrying about getting the “right” answers, and thus could focus on what they were learning. I had them do weekly short reflections on the material, which were graded but very liberally, and with comments (with the help of my wonderful teaching assistants). I provided prompts for the students that asked them about how they perceived the music and how learning about music helped them learn about people, history, or political issues. I always talked about this in class presentations and attempted to get their thoughts and input class discussions, but in such large classes only a few of the same students contributed, week after week. Even with pedagogical tools to encourage engagement (such as “think-pair-share”), class discussion was always a struggle. But on-line I could read everyone’s voice. I could see where they misunderstood, or where they experienced an “ah-ha” moment. I learned along with the students and each had a place where they could communicate with me (or the TAs) directly. The weekly responses were due each week, but I never counted anyone as late.

—MARY NATVIG, BOWLING GREEN STATE UNIVERSITY

Assessment

Prior to the pandemic, assignments in my music history survey courses closely resembled those in my own undergraduate career, some twenty years ago. Students read from the textbook, listened to a lecture, and took examinations consisting of musical examples, important people, vocabulary, and preconceived essay questions. I worked to incorporate more interesting in-class activities, but grades still relied heavily on names and dates; fact-based information that is easily found via a quick Google search. In moving the courses online, I shifted assignments to focus on critical thinking. For each module, students now listen to musical examples and write a reflection on the discussion board, respond to a more provocative discussion prompt centered on issues like the inherent whiteness and maleness of the canon, the narrative of composer as genius, and

the importance of representation, to name a few, and complete an examination consisting of three or four short essay prompts.

Quantitatively, when gauging the effectiveness of assignments and other materials in their understanding of course content (on a scale of 1-5 with 1 indicating “Not helpful” and 5 indicating “Very helpful”), students indicated that the essay examinations were the most helpful (4.31), followed by the diversity of learning materials (4.28), musical reflections (4.10), discussion questions (4.03), and virtual class sessions (3.59). Qualitatively, many students indicated that the discussion questions have been the most valuable component of the course. For example:

The discussion questions have honestly taught me the most about applying what we're learning to other topics that are important.

Honestly, the ability to think about the discussion posts and apply what I've learned not only in this class, but my entire undergraduate career is the best thing I've learned.

With the range of challenges that students faced in the Fall 2020 semester, I decided to eliminate penalties for late assignments. Due dates are still listed online and I maintain the pre-established timing of content in weekly emails to the class and the virtual class sessions. However, students can now plan their time as they see fit, working ahead when feasible and devoting time to other responsibilities when necessary.

On a scale of 1-5 (1 indicating “No. They just help my procrastination.” and 5 indicating “Yes!”), students responded to the question, “Do you appreciate the flexible due dates this semester?” at a 4.76.

—ERIN BAUER, UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN-WHITewater

Flexible Assignments

Deadlines are one of many things that used to feel important but now seem less relevant in the pandemic world. I have experimented with deadlines in two ways recently, both of which have worked well to alleviate the pressure that students often feel and resulted in fewer missing assignments and late penalties.

First, in the Spring of 2020, even before moving online, I designed my “History of Music II” class so that students could complete three out of five writing assignment opportunities. Their grade was an average of however many they had completed, with three as a minimum. When we shifted to virtual learning, I added a sixth option to provide them with additional flexibility. This model worked well, although each of the assignments still carried a firm deadline and many students waited to submit anything until the final three opportunities.

In the Fall of 2020, I made all deadlines “strongly recommended,” but did not penalize students for submitting the assignment up to two weeks late. Students have been much more successful with this added flexibility. Many students do not work well without a deadline; the deadline now simply consists of a larger window of time. I have seen an enormous reduction in missing assignments, as students can complete assignments at their own pace. As an added benefit, I appreciate the slower pace of grading assignments as they come in, rather than grading all at once.

—KRISTEN STRANDBERG, UNIVERSITY OF EVANSVILLE

Flexible Exams

When my courses moved online for Fall 2020, I made all of my exams open-book. I even invited students to collaborate if they so desired, but asked them to disclose their collaboration and write in their own words. To clarify my expectations, I required that they complete a brief ethics tutorial. As in past semesters, I provided students with all of the questions in advance, although I also gave them enough time during the exam to consult sources. My questions are not simple and cannot be answered well without strong foundational knowledge. All exam items require open-ended responses.

Somewhat to my surprise, exam performance fell along almost exactly the same distribution as in past semesters, despite the invitation to use resources and to collaborate. The strongest students did excellent work; a quarter of the class earned grades in the in the D-to-F range, and half the class earned grades in the B-to-C range. I can only conclude that having an open-book exam does not in any way advantage students who have not put in the work to prepare throughout the semester. Despite my repeated warnings not to copy definitions out of the textbook glossary, a handful of the weakest students did exactly that. I had hoped to guide students in expressing their own understanding of

each term, but in these cases I failed, and I concluded that asking students to define terms in an open-book context is not worthwhile. On the final, I instead asked them to use specific terms in context while answering questions, and that worked much better.

I am very satisfied with the revisions that I made to assessment in the Fall 2020 semester. I hate giving up class time for quizzes and exams, so I am delighted to be finding my way toward asynchronous assessment solutions. When I returned to in-person teaching in Spring 2021, I added a weekly asynchronous quiz—one listening response and one short-answer question—in order to track understanding of the material. I have kept my exams online and open-book.

While teaching online, I left substantial feedback for students, but I had no way of knowing whether I had successfully filled gaps or corrected misconceptions. Now I give students the opportunity to revise every quiz and exam. If a student wants to resubmit any answer following feedback, they are welcome to do so. After all, what is the point of assessment if it does not further learning?

—ESTHER MORGAN-ELLIS, UNIVERSITY OF NORTH GEORGIA

Pedagogy of Care

Before the pandemic I thought of myself as a kind and fair teacher. I had clear expectations, goals, detailed syllabi, and flexible office hours. I was always ready to help, always respected my students, and always tried to help them through tough times. But moving to remote instruction last March corresponded with my mother's move to hospice care—at my house (with aides coming in and out at all hours)—and then a month later to a nursing home where she died within a few weeks. All of this chaos altered my thoughts about privilege, what compassion really is, the ability to learn under stress, and how to express unconditional love to my students.

Sometimes I got emails from students: her stepdad had COVID and the fields needed plowing, so she had to work on the farm, sun up to sundown; a grandfather died and no one could visit him in the hospital or go to the funeral; she'd never had a computer and couldn't figure out how to submit the responses; he was so stressed he was going to quit school. And so on.

I learned that I cared much more about my students than about deadlines... or spelling, or critical thinking...we were all just trying to muddle through. I taught what I could, and they learned what they could.

This revelation is a little embarrassing because I always thought I cared deeply about my students; I wanted them to learn, to be responsible, to get good grades, and do a good job. Now I just want them to be okay. You can't learn anything unless you're okay.

—MARY NATVIG, BOWLING GREEN STATE UNIVERSITY

Tech Tools

In the spring of 2020, I started a crowd-sourced document called Teaching Online Tools.⁶ The goal of the spreadsheet was to provide people with a list of online tools for teaching, what they do, what they cost, where they could be found, and their special attributes (for example, potential for integration into a course's Learning Management System [LMS] so that they are FERPA compliant). The tools I use must be low cost or free, intuitive for the user, and compatible with a variety of formats (smartphones, tablets, and computers), as many of my students do not own a tablet, laptop, or desktop computer. The sudden pivot to online instruction has proven that we can use those tools to rethink what's possible in terms of student engagement and active learning in both online and in-person classes. The following is an introduction to some of the tools that I use to support active learning.

Tools such as *StoryMap* allow students to add written text, images, and video links to an online map in order to illuminate a specific topic such as the musical roles of women around the world. In courses such as my world music class, I have students create a StoryMap for a specific topic. They can import a YouTube video of a piece of music they're studying and link it to a specific coordinate on the map. They also are able to add descriptions of the video and the genre, depending on what the task is. This also works well as a team assignment and presentation format.

Glogster is a similar tool that allows students to create multimedia posters on any given topic using text, images, video, and audio, and can zoom in and out on any image on the poster. Glogster even contains the capability to construct

6. Reba Wissner, *Teaching Online Tools*, <https://tinyurl.com/yr999d2y>.

three-dimensional, multimedia posters. These tools allow students to exercise their creativity while demonstrating their command of information.

Annotation tools are also helpful in any learning environment. One, *Perusall*, is a PDF annotation tool that can be used both in and out of the classroom to comment on readings or to teach close reading and analysis skills. Similarly, *Hypothes.is* can be used to annotate any webpage. In a remote environment, students can work together to annotate a single document. This is especially useful when navigating things like digital primary sources.

Padlet is useful because it is a real-time crowdsourcing board with sticky notes that can be moved all over the board. Some universities that use Canvas have a Padlet plugin. In both remote and in-person environments, these boards can be used to generate student responses and organize them. Similarly, *Slack* and *Discord* allow students to communicate outside of the course LMS with messages, message boards, or audio responses. Students can use these tools as backchannels in order to discuss the course, ask others questions, and offer help.

Kialo is a platform that facilitates classroom debate through an online platform. Instructors can post a statement and students can respond to that statement and to each other to provide a debate-like forum in real time. Students are given “pros” and “cons” of a topic or situation and then they write their responses in the appropriate column. They can then respond to one another. In a face-to-face class, the platform could help students prepare for a real-time debate with other students with the pros and cons projected in the classroom.

For flipped classrooms and asynchronous classes, *Play Posit* and *EdPuzzle* are great for creating videos with embedded questions. These programs allow the instructor to embed questions into videos to assess students’ learning (and be sure they are watching the videos). Students cannot view past specific points in the video without answering a set of questions. These tools integrate with the LMS so that faculty can see how each student answered. The ability to check students’ responses allows the instructor to make modifications and clarifications quicker than the next class period.

Video Ant allows students to annotate videos with their own questions, comments, and observations. In a remote environment, it can be used to illustrate how students are interacting with a video. For music courses, students can markup specific elements of a piece or a performance. This can also be done as an individual homework assignment or in teams in an in-person environment.

—REBA WISSNER, COLUMBUS STATE UNIVERSITY

Video Responses

I ask students to create (camera optional) video responses to reading and listening assignments using *Flipgrid*. Flipgrid is a free platform, independent from any LMS, which allows users to post short videos. The instructor can set a time limit for the videos for anywhere between fifteen seconds and ten minutes. They can also make the videos viewable by the entire class or only the individual student and instructor.

Video responses have worked especially well in my courses for non-majors for student responses to reading and listening assignments. I occasionally use Flipgrid in upper-level courses for majors as well. For example, rather than submitting written responses to short analytical assignments, students talked through their answers and thought processes, showing me how they arrived at their conclusions.

Most college-level courses place a heavy emphasis on writing skills and we often neglect other important modes of communication. Hearing a student's thought process verbally, I can more easily assess a student's understanding of the material. While in written work it is sometimes difficult to ascertain whether an issue stems from poor writing skills or a lack of understanding, many students' verbal responses clarify how well they grasp the material. Further, even in an in-person course, the videos allow me to get to know each student a little better.

—KRISTEN STRANDBERG, UNIVERSITY OF EVANSVILLE

Esther M. Morgan-Ellis, ed. *Resonances: Engaging Music in Its Cultural Context*. Dahlonega, GA: University of North Georgia Press, 2020. xi + 552 pp. Open access. \$29.99. ISBN: 978-1-940771-31-1 (paper)

K. DAWN GRAPES

Finding the most appropriate textbook for a music appreciation course requires patience and thoughtful consideration. For decades, a handful of editions have dominated the market. With slightly varying focuses, these books traditionally present canonic Western art music composers and compositions chronologically, situated within defined historical eras, and are accompanied by listening guides and study questions. In recent years, standard content has expanded to include a few noted women, persons of color, and sometimes connections to non-Western musics. These enhancements are important, but they often manifest as isolated add-ons—tokens as it were. Thus, in a never-ending quest for some perfect combination, new textbooks regularly appear from both established and less-recognized publishing companies. Yet very few achieve large-scale distribution. Every so often, however, a scholar introduces a product with the potential to break into the circle of favored texts.

Resonances: Engaging Music in Its Cultural Context, edited by Esther M. Morgan-Ellis, may do just that. The volume has generated quite a bit of buzz since its announced release in early 2020. The textbook was written by Morgan-Ellis and nine of her University of North Georgia music colleagues, whose areas of specialty range from applied performance to composition to music education. All the contributing authors teach music appreciation, providing a well-rounded, practical, and thoughtful presentation, and Morgan-Ellis's editorial guidance assures a consistent authorial voice throughout. A featured story on the University of North Georgia website notes that the book has already been adopted by at least thirty U.S. universities.

While some standard features of *Resonances*, such as listening guides, bolded vocabulary words, and recommended audio links, are commonly found in other music appreciation texts, there are several factors that markedly set this

new textbook apart. The first is the edition's status as an open access textbook. Students and instructors can download the full volume in .pdf format at no cost. For those students who prefer hardcopy, a paperback version is available for a reasonable \$29.99. In our current era, when large portions of the student population are struggling financially, a well-written, high-quality, easily accessible music appreciation text is quite appealing. The edition does not include as many digital and multimedia bells and whistles as some of its competitors, but the tradeoff is well worth it, especially as some established publishers have adopted the practice of issuing expensive new editions more frequently than necessary, while making supplemental digital components available only with newly purchased copies of the latest version of their standard texts.

Also notable is this book's topical, rather than chronological, approach. After a standard introduction that includes an overview of musical elements, subsequent units center on musical storytelling, music in public venues, at court, and at home, nationalistic and political music, and a catchall of "functional" music, which examines religious and other spiritual music, as well as marches and dances. A final unit guides students through historical attempts to evaluate musical value, by examining five selected Pulitzer-Prize-winning compositions that span some seventy-five years. This section would work well at semester end, highlighting changes in style over time, reinforcing concepts introduced earlier in the text, and instilling a recognition that determining musical longevity is a complicated, and often biased, process. While I quite enjoyed this unit and would include it in my own courses, the section could easily be eliminated if necessary, due to time constraints. There is much more musical and historical content found in this textbook than can be covered in a single semester-long course. The editor's introduction makes it clear that instructors should pick and choose among chapter sections, or even complete chapters or units, to best fit their own interests and those of their students.

Resonances is not the first music appreciation textbook to offer a topical organization, but the edition's combination of musical selections from different time periods, places, and musical styles feels fresh and enticing. Folk and popular music, jazz, film music, musical theater, and music of non-Western cultures are interspersed within chapters that also feature Western art music. For example, the music of John Williams and King Oliver stands alongside that of Wagner, Stravinsky, and Holst, and Beyoncé's songs are represented in the same chapter as Schubert, Bobbie Gentry, and traditional *kumbengo* recitations. The book consistently references other selections within and across chapters, creating connections. And although musical examples are quite varied, the role of Western art music is in no way diminished, for it forms the core of the text. There is still much more discussion of "composed" music than of other genres,

but the way in which other styles are juxtaposed against more traditional fare serves to decenter a feeling of canonization.

A large number of twentieth- and twenty-first century art music and jazz compositions are provided for listening and study throughout the volume. These range from symphonic to choral to experimental genres. Female composers receive notable representation, and a special focus is placed on music of the United States. Well-known composers are present, from Beach to Bartók and Cage to Shostakovich, and some newer names such as Caroline Shaw and Catherine Likhuta propel content and analysis into contemporary times. Twentieth-century composers of color, such as Samuel Coleridge-Taylor, Duke Ellington, and Florence Price, find their place within appropriate topical sections. The nineteenth century is also well represented, though less diversely than the twentieth century, with almost two dozen compositions discussed from the time of Beethoven to that of Dvořák.

Earlier music, however, is much less visible and certainly less diverse. Musical examples from the Classical era are limited to the big three: Haydn (with one composition featured), Mozart (five compositions mentioned in a different chapter), and Beethoven (six compositions referenced across three other chapters). While such deliberate separation de-emphasizes the importance these composers are typically afforded as a group, it is a bit disappointing that no others, especially from marginalized communities, are included from this time. Equally distressing for those of us who value early music is the lack of pre-1700 material. While the high Baroque is fairly well represented, Renaissance music is limited to featured examples by Dowland and Palestrina (and for those who would place Dowland on the cusp of the Baroque era, Palestrina stands alone). An overview of Gregorian chant, the Comtessa de Dia's one surviving troubairitz song, and Hildegard von Bingen provide the only illustrations of medieval music.

Traditional and composed music from non-Western cultures is not really featured any more predominantly than in many of the popular music appreciation text revisions of recent years, but once again the topical organization of this edition makes it feel as if there is greater diversity. Perhaps this perception results from the treatment of these musical examples as an integral part of chapters, interspersed alongside art music selections, as opposed to being sectioned off as supplemental material. Admirably, the range of featured non-Western music is expansive, with inclusions from Israel, South Africa, the Caribbean, China, Indonesia, India, the Ukraine, and selected Northern African nations. It is somewhat puzzling then, in a book that consciously highlights music of the U.S., that there are no musical examples from any North American indigenous peoples. Certainly there are many fine, accessible pieces that would fit well into the chapters on

storytelling, music for spiritual expression, dance, or nationalistic/protest music. Likewise, there is a lacuna of musical examples from Mexico, Central and South America. But to be fair, choosing content is always difficult, and there is never a way to include everything, especially in a book that already runs more than 500 pages. Further, there is nothing to prevent instructors from providing their own supplemental inclusions, based on personal preference.

Future editions of the textbook might reconsider the anglicization of composition titles and the presentation of translated texts without side-by-side presentation of the original language. The choice to use primarily English titles seems a bit perplexing in a book that seeks to contextualize music culturally. It also gives the sense that the volume addresses an audience much younger and less sophisticated than that for which it is marketed. While some titles, such as *The Rite of Spring*, *The Four Seasons*, and *The Magic Flute*, have indeed become standard in their English forms over time, there is no reason why college students—even those in the general population who are not actively studying music—cannot recognize and use titles such as *Symphonie Fantastique*, *L'Orfeo* or “Wachet auf,” for language helps to situate compositions in their original place, time, and function. This, of course, is a relatively small matter, and should not detract from the many good features of *Resonances*.

The textbook concludes with three appendices: instruments of the Western orchestra, which some instructors may want to expand to include Sachs-Hornbostel classifications, thereby widening vocabulary for non-Western and early music selections; a list of the book's featured musical examples organized either by historical era, style, or wider geography; and a useful glossary to which students should be directed by their instructors from the very start. Supplemental instructor materials, available upon request, include a set of learning objectives for each chapter, a multiple-choice test bank, and PowerPoint slides in .ppt and .pdf formats for in-classroom or online use.

Resonances is obviously a labor of love, developed over time by a team invested in student learning. As the musicological community struggles to balance tradition with more inclusive representation in the public sphere, this textbook offers a welcome compromise. More importantly, *Resonances* promises to whet the musical appetites of the many students who will grace our classrooms for semesters to come.

C. Matthew Balensuela, ed. *Norton Guide to Teaching Music History*. New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 2019. xxi + 304 pp. \$42.42. ISBN: 978-0-393-64032-8 (paper)

LAURA MOORE PRUETT

Reviewing this book after the onset of COVID-19 and all its associated complications has given me the opportunity to consider its important ideas and suggestions in a new light, given the compounded realities of online and hybrid learning in the face of extraordinary global anxiety and grief that we all faced in the spring of 2020 and will continue to navigate for at least the foreseeable future. While I can offer little in the way of additional pedagogical vision in these uncertain times, I can recommend this book and its contributions to all instructors who teach classes in music history, appreciation, theory, musicology, education, or any other associated area. Its findings and recommendations, as well as many helpful chapter bibliographies, can be useful resources as we navigate these newly turbulent waters.

The Norton Guide to Teaching Music History is structured in four broad parts, preceded by an Introduction by the General Editor, C. Matthew Balensuela: Part I: Style Periods in History and the Survey; Part II: Student Work, Research, and Writing; Part III: Classroom Methods; and Part IV: Approaches. Opening Part I with Peter Burkholder's reflections on "Renewing the Survey" was a smart editorial choice. Burkholder is, of course, the author of Norton's widely used survey textbook *A History of Western Music* (now in its ninth edition), and all but one of the other writers in Part I contributed to the recent series *Western Music in Context: A Norton History*. Written by a well-known and respected senior musicologist, the chapter, taken along with the Introduction, sets up the rest of the book for a winding journey that visits a variety of perspectives and approaches on teaching music history.

The six chapters that follow engage with the traditionally framed periods of music history, giving both voice to and suggestions for pedagogical excellence and associated resources that relate to concerns particular to that time period.

Margot Fassler's chapter, "Medieval Religious Women and Their Music Books," for example, draws attention to a variety of free online resources related to music in the Middle Ages. These are invaluable for instructors at smaller or less extravagantly endowed institutions without funding for paid databases. Her suggestions for in-class activities on medieval chant, while specific, could be easily customized by faculty working in a variety of institutional environments.

This is true of the book as a whole and is one of its best attributes: all the recommendations for and reflections on classroom activities are adaptable as readers see fit for their own institutional and pedagogical objectives. Such ideas and reflections appear in the contributions from Richard Freedman, Wendy Heller, Melanie Lowe, Walter Frisch, and Joseph Auner, taking into consideration along the way such history-specific concerns as performance practice, the limitations of and opportunities inherent in listening to recordings of early music, historicization and historiography, and student music-making. I, for one, will be exploring with my students the 4'33" app, which was made available by the John Cage Trust, and referenced in Auner's "Learning from Contemporary Music" (p. 85, www.johncage.org/4_33.html).

The essays in Parts II and III, "Student Work, Research, and Writing" and "Classroom Methods," respectively, focus on more specific tools and frameworks that again can be applied not only in the music history classroom but throughout our work as educators in higher education. As an excellent example, Jessie Fillerup's "What If? Counterfactual Thinking and Primary Source Study" offers an explication of counterfactuals, that is, thinking along the lines of what *did not happen* or *is not the case*. I have always assumed that it would be a pointless exercise to spend time imagining "what might have been," had Beethoven not lost his hearing or Mozart died so young, as in the case study she shares. Yet it was delightful to read Fillerup's spirited examination of how she uses this device in her classes. For example, students used primary sources as models to create their own "primary materials"—reviews, advertisements, even costume designs and baptismal records—and through the process learn that "alternative history can function as a metacognitive simulation of historiographical processes" (p. 103). Further, Fillerup remarks, "students discover that . . . multiple conclusions may be reasonable in the face of ambiguous or contradictory evidence" (p. 103). These additional, higher-level learning outcomes (as described in Bloom's Taxonomy) enrich and strengthen the fact-based learning that students get in examining the lives and works of these two composers.

Sara Haefeli's "A Survey of Writing Pedagogies in the Music History Classroom" gives an overview of the scholarship of "teaching writing (and thinking) to undergraduate music history students" (p. 120). Her well-researched essay offers much to consider in regard to the structure of writing assignments in our music history classes. She skillfully presents a concise review

of several options for short and long formats, as well as alternative formats, use of primary materials, disciplinary integration with other music courses, and assessment and grading. She closes with a call for further research and “A Word of Encouragement,” ending with a plea for readers to “share what they have learned” and to “join the scholarly discourse” (p. 130).

Misti Shaw’s recommendations for “Information Literacy in Music: Opportunities for Integration in Music History Assignments and Curricula” offer simple but effective strategies to leverage the skills of librarians. She summarizes the simple but powerful *Framework for Information Literacy for Higher Education* produced by the Association of College and Research Libraries (ACRL; <http://www.ala.org/acrl/standards/ilframework>), applying it to the learning objectives of the music history class to great effect. As a former interim music librarian, I was delighted that Shaw’s voice was included among the authorship of this volume, and I second her call for professors to foster strong connections with their institution’s librarians. Information literacy is a vital skill set, and as we forge ahead into the uncharted territory of teaching in a global pandemic, often with plans to incorporate additional practices such as Project-Based Learning and interdisciplinary intersections in our classes, it is only becoming more important for our students and ourselves.

The brief entry titled “Quizmasters, Lectures, and Facilitators: A Qualitative Study of Methodologies in Music History Survey Courses” by Matthew Baumer takes a peek inside the classrooms of our peers, faculty teaching music history at a diverse range of institutions across the U.S. If nothing else, this one study gave me the insight that we are all doing things differently and that there is always room for reconsideration and change. Chapters on worksheets, educational technology, performance studies, and Seaton’s eloquently thoughtful reconsideration of “the Canon” round out the two central Parts of the volume.

Part IV, ambiguously titled “Approaches,” frames the teaching of music history through several specific lenses, including race, gender, politics, international education, and disability. While I recognize the difficulty of titling this group of essays, it seems to me to contain the most important work in the collection, work that calls out the places of marginalization inherent in the study of music. Melanie Zeck and Gillian M. Rodger present comprehensive surveys of the history of musicological pedagogy, in chapters titled “The Transformation of Black Music Pedagogy: A Fifty-Year History” and “Feminist Pedagogy in Musicology: Its History and Application in Teaching.” Both chapters are indispensable for pedagogues just beginning to reconsider the historic narrative centralizing the European white male composer in Western music history. Zeck and Rodger provide models for intersectional learning in our classrooms; their bibliographies alone are well worth investigation. As we are still experiencing the reverberations of the 2020 Black Lives Matter protests in the aftermath

of George Floyd's death, Stephen C. Meyer's statement in "Teaching Across Difference: Music History Pedagogy in an Era of Polarization" feels especially prescient. Meyer writes: "The polarization of American culture—and the attendant politicization of the academy—thus presents us with daunting pedagogical challenges precisely in the moment in which we feel least equipped to meet them" (p. 226).

Finally, the last chapter in the collection, Andrew Dell'Antonio's "Crippling the Music History Classroom: Disability, Accommodation, Universal Design for Learning" had the most impact on me. As an individual who myself experienced the pain and frustration of temporary cognitive and physical impairment in 2018 due to two separate accidents, I spent time reflecting on his articulation of the differences between "impairment" and "disability," the latter of which I have taken to hyphenating as "dis-ability" in my own thinking, so as to keep foremost in mind the ways in which our social life dis-ables the full experience of many impaired individuals. It gave me pause to consider, even after my accidents, how little I had thought about bringing disability into the discourse of the music history classroom, both in regard to course content and in terms of universal design. Moving forward, and especially after the challenges of planning courses in the midst of a global pandemic, my syllabi will be significantly impacted by what I gleaned from Dell'Antonio's essay.

In some of the volume's chapters, authors position their suggestions in a way that seems to presuppose that readers will be teaching music majors in a robust music program at a large university. As a solitary full-time music professor at a liberal arts institution, this struck me at times as out of touch with my own teaching situation, but it did not detract significantly from the overall positive experience of reading the book. One of the aspects of this volume I enjoyed most was its diversity of author perspectives. While the vast majority (17 of the 21 contributors) are Associate or Full Professors at US colleges or universities, many of whom seem to enjoy associated advantages such as graduate assistants, music libraries, and motivated music majors, all of them bring to light their individual challenges in the music history classroom. If nothing else, this diversity gives readers space to recognize their own places as teachers of music history, revealing what I now view as an indisputable truth: there is no "one right way" to teach our subject.

In sum, to borrow from Meyer's chapter, our job is not to "cover" the entire history of human music (or even Western classical music), but "to help students think critically about the ways in which music becomes bound up with powerful emotions and ideas" (p. 232). If all the established musicologists in this collection are going about this work differently, then readers might feel a welcome sense of freedom from the methods and patterns of our own academic training in graduate schools, and begin to turn inward in reflection to discover the "right

way” for ourselves. We should all have the freedom to ask: how best can I teach music history, at my institution, with my students, and acknowledging my own skills, knowledge, and limitations? Further, what are the right choices for me at this time—in my own life and in the present historical moment? Finally, how might my answer change, as the musicological field expands and changes, as I grow and mature and continue to learn? *The Norton Guide to Teaching Music History* cannot supply all the answers, but it helps us navigate the questions and offers many thoughtful, creative, and well-informed inspirations along the way.