

Michael Tenzer and John Roeder, eds. *Analytical and Cross-Cultural Studies in World Music*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011. 472 pages. \$99.00. ISBN 978-0-1953-8458-1. Paperback (\$35.00) ISBN 978-0-1953-8457-4.

PAUL J. YOON

The impetus behind *Analytical and Cross-Cultural Studies in World Music* is basic: comparison. Certainly this desire to discover points of convergence or divergence within cross-cultural musical structures, forms, and meanings precedes the time when “ethnomusicology” was called “comparative musicology.”¹ But rather than seeking broad evolutionary trends, for example,² the authors’ exhaustive analyses compare complementary rhythmic structures and patterns across various musical cultures. This investigation of the structures of musical time unites the text with its partner volume, *Analytical Studies in World Music* (2006).³ Taken by itself, *Analytical and Cross-Cultural Studies in World Music* offers both nuanced details into local music-making practices and “a conceptual map of kinds of musical structure, still coarse for the moment, organized according to relations among the structures themselves rather than their geographic or cultural origins” (p. 417). A companion website provides readers with recordings for musics referenced in the chapters. Some recordings are provided at no charge, while others are available on a separate site for a small fee.

1. See Erica Mugglestone, “Guido Adler’s ‘The Scope, Method, and Aim of Musicology’ (1885): An English Translation with an Historico-Analytical Commentary,” *Yearbook for Traditional Music* 13 (1981): 1–21; Jaap Kunst, *Musicologica: A Study of the Nature of Ethnomusicology, its Problems, Methods, and Representative Personalities* (Amsterdam: Koninklijke Vereeniging Indisch Instituut, 1950); and Alan Merriam, “Definitions of ‘Comparative Musicology’ and ‘Ethnomusicology’: An Historical-Theoretical Perspective,” *Ethnomusicology* 21, no. 2 (May 1977): 189–204.

2. Compare with Carl Stumpf, *Die Anfänge der Musik* (Leipzig: J. A. Barth, 1911).

3. Michael Tenzer, *Analytical Studies in World Music* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006).

This volume is organized into two parts, but Tenzer's "afterword" is significant enough to be considered a third part. The first nine chapters fall under "Part I: Analytical Encounters with Music in Diverse Cultures." These chapters cover a wide range of musics including Japanese *gagaku*, American Indian song, Brazilian *pagode*, the sounds of the BSC improvising community,⁴ fourteenth-century French ballade, and the April 1957 recording of "I Should Care" by Thelonious Monk. Each chapter opens with an introduction to the genre and community under study, making these writings accessible to those without specialized knowledge. The majority of each chapter presents analytical insights into the music and includes many transcriptions, typically in Western musical notation. The hope here is to uncover common ground between theorists, musicologists, performers, composers, and musically literate readers. The level of analysis, and the inclusion of extensive musical transcription, precludes this volume's use in general "world music" survey courses. However, the range of subjects covered and the search for links between seemingly disparate musical cultures, in addition to the academic rigor, will make it a welcome addition to upper-level undergraduate or graduate-level courses in transcription and analysis, as well as Western music theory.

The methodologies used vary from tightly focused musical analysis to ethnographic study, and several essays include both. For example, Jason Stanyek and Fabio Oliveira's chapter, "Nuances of Continual Variation in the Brazilian *Pagode* Song 'Sorrioso Aberto,'" opens with a description of an evening *pagode* that draws the reader's attention to the sights, smells, dances, foods, and musical sounds experienced—a common ethnomusicological/anthropological trope. The authors also discuss the class and racial politics of *pagode* (in relation to samba, for example) and its centrality to notions of place. The bulk of the chapter scrutinizes the musical processes of the song "Sorriso Aberto," with particular attention to long, cyclic processes. Rather than identifying a "standard" form for the song, Stanyek and Oliveira argue that the *pagode* groove is found in sustained variation, and that "patterns are the transitory effects of variation, and not the other way around" (p. 102). Specifically for *pagode*, variation arises through the reciprocal influences of rhythm, harmony and melody, and lyrics.

What is perhaps most important for the editors are the links between musical traditions. The flexible harmonic language in performances of "Sorriso Aberto" relates to Thelonious Monk's recording of "I Should Care"

4. The BSC began in the summer of 2000 by Bhub Rainey and Greg Kelley. This is a Boston-based improvisational community emphasizing the "collaborative intentions of individual improvised decisions [leading] to an instantly *discovered form*." See *Analytical and Cross-Cultural Studies*, p. 228.

(as analyzed by Evan Ziporyn and Michael Tenzer), which in turn connects to Terauchi's analysis of the "deep melody" of "Etenraku." Moreover, this specific type of sectionality, in which the strophe is coterminous with the cycle or section (p. 433), allows for comparisons between "I Should Care," "Sorriso Aberto," and Elizabeth Eva Leach's chapter on Machaut's fourteenth-century ballade, "De Petit Po." Such analogies are the concern of Tenzer's "afterword" because they provide a connection between the particular and the universal. Tenzer states, "While musico-temporal structure may be perceived in different ways depending on its contexts of production and reception, it is important to strive for analytical language able to bridge these modalities" (p. 417). To this end, he offers a "cross-cultural topology of musical time" as a blueprint for the cross-cultural discussion of musical structures.

Tenzer's chapter, "Integrating Music: Personal and Global Transformations," is one of two articles for "Part II: Cross-Cultural Analytical Comparisons." It begins, in essence, with the question that is perhaps primary in any comparative endeavor: on what grounds is comparison even possible? This chapter challenges Judith Becker's assertion that "music systems are simply incommensurable."⁵ Tenzer disagrees and sets off to compare a piano quartet by Robert Schumann and a pair of Balinese *gamelan* compositions from the *lelambatan* genre (a category of sacred music). He raises a number of questions that might be posed as a challenge to the reader: what personal criteria do we use in measuring artistic value? Do these values arise from one cultural perspective, or do they vary according to the demands of each new musical encounter? Is it even possible to absorb fully other musical aesthetics and ontologies? For Tenzer, it is through comparison that insights arise and compatibilities are recognized; this process alone validates the endeavor.

It would be incorrect to label this text as solely ethnomusicological. More precise would be to call it simply and broadly musicological or, to use another buzzword, interdisciplinary. Though the musical cultures studied in individual chapters are geographically and chronologically separated, critical and unforeseen insights emerge when examined with an ear toward comparison. The importance of such a volume is the way it compiles various analyses to lay bare these convergent and divergent processes.

5. Judith Becker, "Is Western Art Music Superior?" *The Musical Quarterly* 72, no. 3 (Autumn 1986): 341–59; quoted in Tenzer and Roeder, *Analytical and Cross-Cultural Studies*, 359.